Case 1:05-cv-00120-JJF Document 265-3 Filed 05/08/2008 Page 1 of 59

Hughes, Randall (Video) 10/16/2006 12:00:00 PM

		1	•
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	1	
2	IN AND FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE	2	
3	MONA DOBRICH and MARCO : Case No. 15-120 (JJF) DOBRICH, Individually and :	3	TABLE OF CONTENTS
4	as parents and next friend:	1	
	of ALEXANDER DOBRICH, :	4	TESTIMONY OF RANDALL HUGHES:
5	SAMANTHA DOBRICH, JANE DOE :	5	Direct Examination by Mr. Horvath 4
6	and JOHN DOE, individually : and as parents and next :	6	Certificate of Reporter
·	friend of JORDAN DOE and ;		
7	JAMIE DOE, :	7	
_	; Plaintiffs, ;	8	
8	Hantina' :	9	INDEX TO EXHIBITS
9	v. :	10	Plaintiff's Exhibit 58
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
10	INDIAN RIVER SCHOOL :	11	
11	DISTRICT, et al., :	12	
	Defendants. ;	13	
12		14	
13	Video Deposition of RANDALL HUGHES, taken pursuant to notice, on Monday, October 16, 2006	1	
14	at 2:40 p.m. at 31 Hosier Street, Selbyville,	15	
1	Delaware, reported by Lorena J. Hartnett, a Registered	16	
15	Professional Reporter and Notary Public.	17	
16 17	APPEARANCES:	18	
17 18	THOMAS ALLINGHAM, ESQUIRE		
	RICHARD HORVATH, ESQUIRE	19	
19	One Rodney Square	20	
20	Wilmington, DE 19801 Attorneys for the Plaintiff	21	
21	Unottake to the Liebbin	22	
22			
23	WILCOX & FETZER	23	
24	1330 King Street - Witmington, DE 19801 (302) 655-0477	24	
	A THE STATE OF THE	2	4
1	APPEARANCES (CONTINUED):	1	(The videographer read the
2	,	2	introduction, and the attorneys introduced
~	JASON P. GOSSELIN, ESQUIRE		
_		3	themselves.)
3	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP	4	RANDALL HUGHES,
	One Logan Square	5	HAVING FIRST BEEN DULY SWORN, TESTIFIED AS FOLLOWS:
4	18th and Cherry Streets	6	DIRECT EXAMINATION ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFF
	Philadelphia, PA 19103-6996		
5	Attorney for the Defendants	7	BY MR. HORVATH:
6		8	Q. Good afternoon. Have you ever been deposed
7		9	before?
В		10	A. Yes.
9		İ	
		11	Q. When?
10		12	A. The last time was in December of 2005.
11		13	Q. How many times have you been deposed?
12		1	
13		14	A. Ten or so, perhaps.
		1 45	Q. What were the natures of the actions?
14		15	
14 15		16	A. Mostly traffic-related accidents, civil
15		16	
15 16		16 17	suits, in those regards. Also, the latest was in a
15 16 17		16	
15 16 17 18		16 17	suits, in those regards. Also, the latest was in a
15 16 17		16 17 18	suits, in those regards. Also, the latest was in a lawsuit filed against the State Police I did for my
15 16 17 18		16 17 18 19 20	suits, in those regards. Also, the latest was in a lawsuit filed against the State Police I did for my workplace. Q. Have you ever testified at trial?
15 16 17 18 19		16 17 18 19 20 21	suits, in those regards. Also, the latest was in a lawsuit filed against the State Police I did for my workplace. Q. Have you ever testified at trial? A. Yes.
15 16 17 18 19 20		16 17 18 19 20	suits, in those regards. Also, the latest was in a lawsuit filed against the State Police I did for my workplace. Q. Have you ever testified at trial?
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22		16 17 18 19 20 21	suits, in those regards. Also, the latest was in a lawsuit filed against the State Police I did for my workplace. Q. Have you ever testified at trial? A. Yes.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21		16 17 18 19 20 21 22	suits, in those regards. Also, the latest was in a lawsuit filed against the State Police I did for my workplace. Q. Have you ever testified at trial? A. Yes. Q. How many times have you testified at trial?

Hughes, Randall (Video) 10/16/2006 12:00:00 PM

Page 3 of 59

1 MR. GOSSELIN: Do you have an extra self interests? 1 2 2 copy? A. Yes, it does. 3 MR. HORVATH: I do. 3 Q. So, with the first paragraph that we read and 4 BY MR. HORVATH: 4 the last paragraph that we read, should the board, do 5 Q. Have you ever seen this document before? 5 you feel that it's now appropriate for the board to 6 A. I need to --6 pass policies that are for the benefit of the board 7 Q. Okay. 7 member's individual constitutional rights? 8 A. The answer is I am not sure if I have read 8 A. Yes, I do, and the reason why --9 this before or not. I have read a couple things on 9 Q. I was going to say --10 ethics and integrity by the I think Ethics and 10 A. You want to ask me first? Okay. I read that 11 Integrity Commission after being elected. So I am not 11 first paragraph on the second page as not to bring or 12 sure if it was this exact document, but it seems 12 bear influence upon any educational decisions that may 13 familiar to me. 13 be made by staff or superintendents to benefit me 14 Q. To be clear, in the upper right hand corner 14 personally or a friend or a family member. That's how 15 there are three letters, BDF? 15 I read that paragraph. 16 A. Uh-huh. 16 Q. But I think you had stated before that it is 17 Q. Do you know what those letters might signify? 17 an appropriate exercise of a board member's authority 18 18 A. No, sir, I do not. to pass a policy that protects their own individual 19 Q. Have you ever received any copies of board 19 constitutional rights? 20 policies or policies that pertain to board 20 A. As I said, because of future boards, as well. 21 governments? 21 Protecting constitutional rights is for all of us to 22 22 A. Yes, sir, I have. 23 Q. And do those policies start with the letter 23 Q. And what the board perceives as their own 24 B? 24 individual rights that don't apply to anyone else in 69 71 the district? 1 A. When I receive those, I read the verbiage, 1 2 and I have not looked for that, but I bet when I go 2 A. To future boards, yes. 3 home I will look and see if they are on there or they 3 Q. Outside of the board? 4 will be. 4 A. Protecting a constitutional right is 5 Q. I am going to represent that this is a copy everyone's responsibility. 6 of the school board's, school board member ethics 6 Q. I am going to read to you four prayers. I am 7 7 policy. Under number one on the first page, the third going to want your opinion as to whether or not those paragraph down, it states that, "The public expects my 8 prayers violate the policy. 8 9 first and greatest concern to be in the best interests 9 The first prayer, "Lord, I pray that you of each and every one of these young people without 10 correct the heathens before me now to the truth that 10 11 distinction as to who they are or what their 11 comes by knowing you." Oh, I'm sorry, I misread it. 12 background may be." 12 "Lord, I pray that you convert the heathens before me 13 To be clear, does this paragraph state that 13 now to the truth that comes by knowing you." 14 the board, a board member's primary concern should be 14 A. Yes, I believe that that -- Again, I am 15 the students of the district? 15 basing this on is that a part of or is that the sole? 16 A. Yes, it does. 16 That's it, period? Based on those exact words you 17 Q. And on the second page, the third paragraph 17 just said, yes, that could be a conflict. 18 down, it says, "To resist every temptation and outside 18 Q. And why would it be in conflict with policy? 19 pressure to use my position as a school board member 19 A. I looked at paragraph number three. It's 20 to benefit either myself or any other individual or 20 kind of mean. 21 agency apart from the total interest of the school 21 Q. It's kind of mean? 22 district." 22 A. Kind of mean when you are saying that. 23 Does that paragraph suggest to you that board 23 Q. What's mean about it? members should not operate out of their own individual 24 A. You are referring to someone as a heathen.

70

6

7

11

20

22

5

Hughes, Randall (Video) 10/16/2006 12:00:00 PM

- 1 Q. Is there -- Suppose it wasn't heathen, it was just "the individuals in front of me."
 - A. Again, read it without the heathen.
 - Q. "Lord, I pray that you convert the people
 - before me to the truth that comes by knowing you."
 - A. Certainly the word convert.
- 7 Q. So it's a combination of both heathens and 8 convert that you find problematic?
- 9 A. Uh-huh.

3

4

5

6

3

4

7

8

9

- 10 Q. And each one individually would pose a11 problem?
- 12 A. Yes, sir, I believe so.
- 13 Q. I am going to hand you what has been
- 14 previously marked as PX35, which reads, "Do not put
- 15 your trust in princes and mortal men who cannot even
- 16 save themselves. When their spirit departs, they
- 17 return to the ground. On that very day, their plans
- 18 come to nothing. Blessed is he whose help is the God
- 19 of Jacob, whose hope is in the Lord his God, the maker
- 20 of heaven and earth, the sea and everything in them,
- 21 the Lord who remains faithful forever. He upholds the
- 22 cause of the oppressed and gives food to the hungry.
- 23 The Lord sets prisoners free. The Lord gives sight to
 - the blind. The Lord lifts up those who are bowed

- trying to espouse my views forcefully onto someone
 else.
- Q. Do you believe that the last sentence of theprayer is not proselytizing?
 - A. No, I do not.
 - Q. How do you think you would respond to this prayer if you were not a Christian?
- 8 A. Mr. Horvath, that's very difficult to answer.
- 9 I would probably rely back on the very first thing
- 10 that I said, did I find it offensive. No, I did not.
 - Q. If you were not a Christian and you heard,
- 12 "for the wages of sin is death but the gift of God is
- 13 eternal life through Jesus Christ our Lord," do you
- 14 think you would find that offensive?
- 15 A. In the spirit or in the tone in which you
- 16 read this, I did not find it offensive, and I don't --
- 17 It's hard for me to answer that question other than to
- 18 say I did not find it offensive.
- Q. Do you think your personal faith as a
 - Christian might impact your views on whether this
- 21 particular prayer is proselytizing?
 - A. Yes, sir, I am sure that it does.
- 23 Q. To put a variation on this, suppose the last
- 24 sentence read, "For the wages of sin is death, but the

73

75

- down. The Lord loves the righteous. The Lord watchesover the alien and sustains the fatherless and the
 - widow, but he frustrates the ways of the wicked. For the wages of sin is death, but the gift of God is
- eternal life through Jesus Christ our Lord."
 Do you believe that this prayer would
 - Do you believe that this prayer would be permissible under the policy?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. How did you make that determination?
- 10 A. I did not find it offensive.
- 11 Q. Is that the touchstone you use for whether or
- 12 not a prayer violates the policy, whether or not you
- 13 find it offensive?14 A. I don't see
 - A. I don't see -- Yes, that's the first thing I
- 15 am going to rely on, how do I perceive that. I do not
- 16 find it offensive. I don't see where it's violating
- 17 number three of the policy, paragraph number three.
- 18 Q. I take it you do not view the prayer in PX3519 as proselytizing?
- 20 A. Which one is that?
- 21 Q. The one I just handed you?
- 22 A. No, sir, I don't.
- 23 Q. What does proselytizing mean to you?
- 24 A. Again, to me it's preaching or negative,

- gift of Allah is eternal life through his prophetMuhammed."
- A. Again, I do not find that offensive. Thereare more people in this world than I.
 - Q. Uh-huh.
- 6 A. And, as I said, my religion is very
- 7 individual, very personal, and other people may find
- 8 their religion that way, as well, and I don't find it
- 9 offensive. I wouldn't find it offensive if you insert
- 10 any other deity that you like.
- 11 Q. I have another prayer. This has been
- 12 previously marked PX45. "Heavenly Father, thank you
- 13 for this great occasion, for the work, the effort, the
- joys and everything that led up to this point in time.
- 15 Thank you for your guidance in this event. We pray
- 16 for your direction in the lives of each of these
- school board members. We pray that you direct theminto the truth and eventually the truth that comes by
- 19 knowing Jesus. We also pray that you would be with
- 19 knowing Jesus. We also play that you would be wi
- 20 them at this time. We ask these things in Jesus's
- 21 name. Amen."
- 22 Do you believe that this prayer would violate
- 23 paragraph three of the policy?
- 24 A. No.

Hughes, Randall (Video) 10/16/2006 12:00:00 PM

1 Q. I take it that you do not view this prayer as 2 proselytizing?

A. No.

3

4

5

9

10

11 12

Q. And did you reach that conclusion again because you did not find this prayer offensive?

6 A. That and the fact that it specifically states 7 to the board members. It refers specifically to board 8

Q. Is your primary concern whether or not a prayer is directed to the board members or mentions anyone outside the board? Is that the first step in your analysis?

13 A. I am not so sure. It's the first step.

There may be multiple, multiple steps that consciously 14

15 I am not able to verbalize to you, but I don't find it

16 offensive, I do not find it's in violation of the

17 policy.

18 Q. And you do not view the phrase, "We pray that 19 you direct them into the truth and eventually the

20 truth that comes by knowing Jesus," as an attempt to

convert anyone who is hearing that or convert the 21

22 board members?

23 A. No.

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9 10

14 15

16

17

Q. I have one last one. This isn't written

1 A. Yes, yes.

3

6

11

19

20

24

2

6

8

2 Q. And, I think we have established before, but

I wanted to be clear again, you have never been

4 offered an opportunity to open a meeting with a prayer

5 or a moment of silence?

A. Not that I recall, no.

7 Q. Do you know if the board ever considered,

8 didn't discuss with you, but at any point in the past

ever considered whether to open its meetings with a 9

10 moment of silence?

A. No, I do not.

12 Q. Can you look at paragraph number two of the

13 policy? It states, "On a rotating basis one

14 individual adult board member per meeting will be

15 given the opportunity to offer up prayer or request a 16 moment of silence. If the member chooses not to

17 exercise this opportunity, the next member in rotation

18 shall have the opportunity."

> Am I correct that means that if an individual passes, the prayer or moment of silence opportunity

21 will continue on until you get a board member who

22 takes up the opportunity? So, in other words, suppose

23 you pass, and then the next individual in line,

suppose Hattier passes, would it continue to pass

77

down, so if you can't follow along, I will read it

"Allah, we offer you our school bus drivers, we offer you our superintendent, our administrators, and our secretaries. We offer you our teachers and our parents. Finally, we offer you our students. Peace be unto your prophet, Muhammed." How do you view that prayer?

A. I do not find it offensive, and I do not find that it's in violation of this policy.

Q. How would you feel if you were in the 11 audience hearing that prayer and hearing that you were 12 13 being offered to a deity of a different religion?

A. I do not find it offensive at all. I don't find it offensive at all.

Q. Do you think the school board could open its meetings with a moment of silence instead of a prayer?

18 A. Yes, that is an option.

19 Q. Have you ever discussed with any board member whether the board should open its meetings with a 20

21 moment of silence?

22 A. No, I have not.

23 Q. If given the opportunity, would you open a

board meeting with a moment of silence?

1 between the board members until a board member chos

to open the meeting with a prayer or moment of

3 silence?

A. That could be a way that it could happen, but 4

5 I am not so sure that's how it happens. Like I said,

I don't recall ever being asked to do that.

7 Q. Just as a matter of reading the policy,

itself.

9 A. Yeah, I don't know if that's something that 10

could be worked out. I don't know if somebody wanted

to say, "I would like to offer the prayer." Perhaps 11

12 that's how they do it. Like I say, I have not been

13 asked. Oftentimes, I am running late, but I have not

14

15 Q. Based on reading paragraph number two of the

16 policy, would you say, would you agree that in order

17 for a board meeting to not open with a prayer or

18 moment of silence, each board member would have to

19 decline the opportunity?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Put another way, if at least one board member

22 wants to open the meeting with a prayer, the meeting

23 is going to open with a prayer?

24 A. Yes.

80

ProBono/Dobrich

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

20

1

2

5

6

7

Hughes, Randall (Video) 10/16/2006 12:00:00 PM

A. Yes, I received lots of questions from a lot
of different local newspapers. One of the questions a
lot of times did deal with the prayer issue and my
feelings. Since I had already been appointed to the
board and I was operating under the gag order, my
response was, "Pending litigation, I am just not at
liberty to discuss that."
O Did anyone from the public ask you about

 Q. Did anyone from the public ask you about board praver?

A. If they did, my answer was, "There is a gag order, pending litigation, we can't talk about that." I don't have that many -- There was no campaign --There was no stump speeches made or anything like that.

Just you might see someone in the supermarket and talk to them about some school board issues, but I don't recall that being a very specific question asked to me.

Q. Do you think it's understood by the public that you support board prayer?

A. No, I wouldn't necessarily say that that's 21 22 understood. And are you implying that I do support 23 school prayer?

85

24 Q. Okay, maybe I will --

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

was a bit misinformed 1 2

Q. You refer to the gag order. This gag order didn't prevent you from telling your constituents whether or not you supported board prayer? Did you tell constituents that the gag order prevented you from ---

A. Yeah, my answers that I put out to the newspapers were that I didn't want to discuss that topic or I couldn't discuss that because of pending litigation.

Q. Let's go back to your opponent. Am I correct, at the very least, that the perception became that he opposed board prayer?

14 A. Yeah, I believe think that would be --

15 Q. And that was an accurate representation --16 I'm sorry, I guess I should have let you finish.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And was that an accurate representation of 19 what you understood his position to be?

A. Yes.

21 Q. Do you believe that affected the campaign?

22 A. My opponent had some, quite a few different

23 ideas. I am not so sure that one particular answer 24 that he gave led to his demise. I am not so sure.

87

1 MR. GOSSELIN: He said board prayer. 2 THE WITNESS: Oh, board prayer? 3 MR. HORVATH: Yeah. THE WITNESS: Oh, okay. 4 5 MR. GOSSELIN: You mean the policy. MR. HORVATH: Yes. 6 7 MR. GOSSELIN: This policy here. THE WITNESS: Okay. Okay. 8 9

BY MR. HORVATH:

10 Q. So, to be clear on this, do you think the 11 public understands you to support policy BDA.1 in the 12 board's prayer practice?

13 A. Probably.

16

17

18

21

22

23

14 Q. And do you think they understood that during 15 the election?

A. I am not - I don't know. I didn't -- Like I said, when it came to any talk about the litigation, I didn't say a word about it.

Q. Do you know what your opponent's view on 19 20 board prayer was?

A. Yes, he was to stop board prayer, stop -- It was kind of a bit skewed in that it was drawn out to include school prayer, prayer in school, took on a

whole different light. I think perhaps the gentleman

86

Q. Did anyone from the community tell you that they were not going to vote for him because he opposed 3 board prayer? 4

A. I don't recall. Well, people who supported me said, "I am going to vote for you." They didn't say, "I am going to vote for you because of X, Y or Z."

8 Q. Did anyone say they were going to vote for 9 you because you supported board prayer?

10 A. No, I don't recall having that conversation 11 with anyone.

12 Q. Do you believe that someone could get, in the 13 2006 election, do you believe that anyone could have 14 been elected to the board who openly opposed board 15 prayer?

16 A. If you articulate your point of view and some 17 of the reasons behind it, perhaps, yes.

18 Q. Has anyone told you that they see this case 19 as about protecting Christian values?

20 A. Yes, I have heard that. Have they told me

21 that? I don't -- I have not been told that, but I 22

have kind of heard. Again, that's like supermarket or

Wawa coffee stand talk sometimes. You kind of hear 23 24

these kinds of things.

7

8

9

Hughes, Randall (Video) 10/16/2006 12:00:00 PM

1 Q. Have these things been told to you, or did 2 you overhear it?

3

4

5

6

22

3

4

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

A. Well, if I heard it, then it was told to me. But, again, it wasn't someone grabbing me by the shirt collar and saying, "This is about maintaining

Christian values and beliefs." 7 Q. Did anyone say that the board's prayer 8 practice, itself, was about protecting Christian 9 values?

10 A. I don't recall that, that terminology being 11 used.

12 Q. Do you think people understand this case as involving the board prayer policy? 13

14 A. To be perfectly honest with you, I think 15 there is a lot of misinformation. A lot of people are 16 out there and don't have all the information from 17 which to make a decision on this. Shortsightedness, a 18 particular mind set, but the perception out there is 19 it comes down to a single issue or something that it 20 may or may not be, so I think -- I don't know if the gag order was helpful or not with people not going out 21

and talking about it. 23 Q. What's the single issue that you believe the 24 public perceives this case is about?

1 there are many sides to every story and there are many 2 facets to this particular case.

3 Q. Do you believe that a gag order is still in 4 place? 5

A. Yes, I am operating under that -- I am going to operate under that until otherwise directed by either Jason or a judge.

Q. Has anyone told you that a gag order is no longer in place, aside from your attorneys or a judge?

10 A. No. Has anyone ever -- I'm sorry, say that 11 again, please.

12 Q. Has, aside from your attorneys or a judge, 13 has anyone told you that a gag order is no longer in 14 place?

15 A. There was some discussion in an executive 16 session if there was or there wasn't, but the bottom 17 line it came down to, as I left there, my 18 understanding was that there was, do not discuss.

19 Q. And you have continued to operate under that 20 assumption since then?

21 A. That's the way I have been operating, yes, 22 sir.

23 Q. Has anyone told you they believe the ACLU is involved with this case? 24

89

91

1 A. I believe the public thinks this is about 2 prayer in schools.

Q. Have you ever heard anyone say that this case is about board prayer?

5 A. Mr. Horvath, I can't sit here and tell you that I have heard that. I just -- I believe that the 6 7 perception out there in the public is that this case 8 is about prayer in schools. 9

Q. Do you know if any school board member has campaigned for election or re-election on the ground that they support school board prayer?

A. We had several elections last time. I have a lot of things going on. I didn't have an opportunity to follow everyone else's campaign, if you will call a school board election a campaign. How and what exactly they said or didn't say at their different functions, I don't know.

Q. You mentioned before what you characterized as a misrepresentation that this case is about prayer in schools. Have you done anything to correct that mis-perception?

22 A. Again, how I refer to anything that's brought 23 up about this case is there is a gag order. My

responses are very limited, pretty much to zero, and

A. I believe at executive sessions there have 1 been some mention that the ACLU is behind this case, 2 3 yes.

4 Q. Do you believe that the ACLU is behind this 5 case?

6 A. I don't know that for a fact.

Q. Have you ever discussed with someone in the community as to whether or not the ACLU is involved in this case?

10 A. No, sir.

7

8

9

11 Q. Has anyone told you that they see this case 12 as standing up to the ACLU?

13 A. No, I don't recall having that conversation.

14 Q. Which board members told you that the ACLU 15 was involved with this case?

16 A. Again, I think that's a discussion in 17 executive session, and I cannot -- I feel like I am

18 pointing fingers, because I am not 100 percent sure,

19 but I believe that perhaps Nina Lou Bunting may have 20 mentioned that.

Q. Have any of the board members described the 21 22 ACLU as anti Christian?

23 A. No, I don't recall hearing that.

24 Q. Has anyone in the public described the ACLU

90

Hughes, Randall (Video) 10/16/2006 12:00:00 PM

1 as anti Christian that you are aware of? 1 good schools and making some wise decisions. A lot of 2 A. Not that I am aware of, but you have to 2 my -- A lot of my campaign was along those avenues. 3 remember that not that long ago our community, the 3 Q. You limited your answer on that to your 4 Seaford, western Sussex community had a visit from 4 campaign and your interests on the school board. Can Westboro Baptist Church at a soldier's funeral which 5 5 we expand that to the other school board members who 6 did, if you will, muddy the waters with some ACLU 6 were either elected or reelected in 2006? In other 7 things were bantering around about that. So I don't 7 words, have you discussed with anyone whether their 8 8 remember the public ever telling me anything about election or re-election was an endorsement of the 9 ACLU and the school district, but it has been used in 9 stance the school board has taken in support of school 10 that context with Westboro Baptist Church. 10 board prayer? 11 Q. Could you explain a little bit more what 11 A. No, I have not. happened in that context? Q. And you have heard --12 12 A. The Westboro Baptist Church? 13 A. I have not discussed that with them. 13 14 Q. Yes, please. 14 Q. With anyone from the public? 15 A. Pretty inflammatory comments being made, 15 A. No. Q. Do you know if school board members 16 viewed as derogatory by the public, towards the family 16 17 and to the soldier that had been killed. 17 campaigned stating that they were, a vote for them Q. And how did the ACLU become involved in that? 18 would be a vote for prayer in fighting the ACLU? 18 19 A. I do not know that to be a fact. 19 A. The perception was either it was or it 20 wasn't -- I don't know if the perception was that MR. HORVATH: Thank you very much. ! 20 21 don't think I have any more questions. 21 they were protecting the Westboro Baptist Church, they were the legal arm of the Westboro Baptist 22 THE WITNESS: Thank you. 22 23 VIDEOGRAPHER: Deposition ending Church. I don't know for a fact if that's factual or 23 24 approximately 5:06 p.m. 24 not. 95 93 CERTIFICATE 1 Q. So people understood -- To understand your 1 testimony there, you understand the public perceptions 2 I, Lorena J. Hartnett, a Notary Public and 2 3 being the ACLU was protecting an organization that was 3 Registered Professional Reporter, do hereby certify making disparaging comments about a dead soldier or 4 that the witness, RANDALL HUGHES, was by me first 4 5 5 duly sworn to testify the truth, the whole truth, and the soldier's family? 6 nothing but the truth; that the foregoing deposition A. That's the perception that I had heard, yes, 6 7 7 was taken at the time and place stated herein; and 8 Q. And at any point during that -- At any point 8 that the said deposition was recorded stenographically in that series of events did anyone make a reference 9 by me and then reduced to typewriting under my 9 10 10 to the ACLU as anti-Christian? direction, and constitutes a true record of the A. No, I have not heard ACLU anti-Christian, no. 11 testimony given by said witness. 11 12 I further certify that the inspection, 12 Q. Okay. Have you discussed with anyone whether 13 reading and signing of said deposition was not waived 13 the 2006 election was an enforcement of the stance the 14 school board has taken in support of school board 14 by counsel for the parties and by the witness. 15 prayer? 15 I further certify that I am not a relative, 16 A. No. 16 employee, or attorney of any of the parties or a 17 Q. Have you ever heard anyone say that? 17 relative or employee of either counsel, and that I am A. Not to me. My stance, if I can go for a 18 in no way interested directly or indirectly in this 18 19 little bit further, construction costs, the huge action. 19 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my 20 amount of monies we spend as a school district in 20 construction and projects. All right? I am the 21 hand and affixed my seal of office on this 20th day of 21 22 22 October 2006. construction auv. 23 23 I think that we have to hold some folks 24 Cert. #134-RPR, Exp. 01-31-2008 accountable with their tax dollars in building some

ProBono/Dobrich Unsigned Page 93 - 96

Hughes, Randall (Video) 10/16/2006 12:00:00 PM

Q. Under paragraph number five, it states that, "The prayer or moment of silence should be in accord with the freedom of conscience, speech and religion of the individual board member."

Is it possible that a board member could decide that he or she wouldn't want the meeting to open with a prayer or moment of silence consistent with their freedom of conscience?

- A. Yes, that is possible.
- 10 Q. Would the policy deny them that opportunity, 11 provided that at least one board member wants the 12 meeting to open with a prayer or moment of silence?
- 13 A. There could be some conflict there, yes.
- 14 Q. Do you know, and not speaking of yourself, do 15 you know if any board member has declined an
- 16 opportunity to open a meeting with prayer?
- A. I do not know. 17
- 18 Q. Has a board member ever said they wanted to 19 open a meeting with a prayer but wanted someone from
- the audience to give the prayer?
- 21 A. I don't recall that ever happening.
- 22 Q. Do you think the policy permits someone other
- 23 than a board member to give the prayer?
 - A. No, I don't think this policy would permit

- session to open with a prayer? 1
- 2 A. I don't know.
 - Q. Did the board deliberate in the executive
- 4 session?

3

5

- A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Would the prayer have been beneficial in the 7
 - executive session for those deliberations?
- 8 A. That's an individual, each individual has to 9 answer that question.
- 10 Q. Were those deliberations conducted in a solemn manner? 11
- 12 A. Some executive sessions are lively. Yes, the 13 overall answer is yes.
- 14 Q. So a prayer wasn't necessary for those
- 15 deliberations to be conducted in a solemn manner?
- 16 A. That is correct.
- 17 Q. I want to clarify. Have any special meetings
- 18 been opened with a prayer?
- 19 A. Special meetings? Um, I don't think so. I
- 20 don't think so. Again, I cannot be 100 percent sure
- 21 on that, but I don't think so.
 - Q. And, again, has the board or, similarly to
- 23 before, has the board deliberated during those special
- 24 meetings?

22

2

7

8

9

10

11

12

15

83

1 that.

24

4

7

10

11

12

13

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

- 2 Q. Does the board open its special meetings or its executive sessions with a prayer?
 - A. Executive session? No, no, sir.
- 5 Q. And why is that?
- A. I don't know. I would assume that if you go 6
 - back to paragraph one, the proceedings have already
- 8 been solemnified, if you will, so -- You can say it 9 better, Jason.
 - MR. GOSSELIN: I keep messing it up. I don't know if it's solemnize or solemnify.
 - A. Yeah, solemnify. That's much better. It's
 - done once. How many times -- And I know you -- I
- 14 don't want to -- It's okay to pray more than once,
- 15 but, you know, how many times in the same course of
- 16 business would you do that and why would you do that?
- 17 Q. Since you joined the board, has the board
- 18 ever met in executive session before the regular
- meeting? 19
- 20 A. Yes, it has.
- Q. Did that executive session open with a 21
- 22 praver?
- A. No, it did not. 23
- 24 Q. Why did the board wait until the public

- A Yes 1
 - Q. And was the board able to deliberate in a
- 3 solemn manner?
- 4 A. Again, some of them were more lively than 5 others, but overall, yes.
- 6 Q. And a prayer wasn't necessary for those
 - special meetings to be conducted in a solemn manner? A. That is correct.
 - VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the record at approximately 4:46 p.m.
 - (A recess was taken.)
 - VIDEOGRAPHER: Back on the record
- 13 approximately 4:51 p.m.
- 14 BY MR. HORVATH:
 - Q. Is it correct that you had to run for
- 16 re-election this year?
- 17 A. Yes. I had to run to be elected since I was
- 18 appointed.
- 19 Q. Okay. Was your campaign contested?
- 20
- 21 Q. During the campaign did anyone discuss with
- 22 you school board prayer?
- 23 A. From media? Are you referring to the media.
- Q. We will start with media. 24

4	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	1 1	
1 2	FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE	1	
3	MONA DOBRICH and MARCO : C.A. No. 15-120 (JJF)	2	
4	DOBRICH, Individually and : as parents and next friend :	3	
4	of ALEXANDER DOBRICH, :	4	TABLE OF CONTENTS
5	SAMANTHA DOBRICH, JANE DOE :	5	TESTIMONY OF DR. MARK A. ISAACS:
	and JOHN DOE, Individually:		
6	and as parents and next : friend of JORDAN DOE and :	6	Direct Examination by Mr. Allingham 3
7	JAMIE DOE, :	7	Certificate of Reporter
	:	8	
8	Plaintiffs, : :	9	
9	v. :		
40	: INDIAN RIVER SCHOOL :	10	
10	DISTRICT, et al., ;	11	
11	:	12	
40	Defendants. :	13	
12 13	Videotaped Deposition of DR. MARK A. ISAACS,		
.*	taken pursuant to notice, on Wednesday, October 18,	14	
14	2006 at 1:36 p.m. at 31 Hosler Street, Selbyville,	15	
15	Delaware, reported by Lorena J. Hartnett, a Registered Professional Reporter and Notary Public.	16	
16		17	
17	APPEARANCES:		
18	THOMAS ALLINGHAM, ESQUIRE RICHARD HORVATH, ESQUIRE	18	
19	BRIAN LENHARD, ESQUIRE	19	
	One Rodney Square	20	
20	Wilmington, DE 19801 Attorney for the Plaintiff		
21	, morried, too the Chapter	21	
22	MILOOY & CETTED	22	
23	WILCOX & FETZER 1330 King Street - Wilmington, DE 19801	23	
24	(302) 655-0477	24	
	www.wilfet.com		
		2	
1		1	VIDEOGRAPHER: This is the videotaped
2		2	deposition of Dr. Mark A. Isaacs, taken by
3		3	the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich et
4	APPEARANCES: (CONTINUED)	i	·
5	JARROD SHAU, ESQUIRE	4	al, versus Indian River School District, et
•		5	al Civil Action Number 15-120. The
_	Orinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP	6	deposition is taking place at 31 Hosier
6	One Logan Square	7	Boulevard in Selbyville, Delaware, on
	18th and Cherry Streets	l l	
7	Philadelphia, PA 19103-6996	8	October 18, 2006 at approximately 1:36 p.m.
	Attorney for the Dafendants	9	The court reporter is Lorena Hartnett
8		10	from the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer. My name
9		11	is Mark Buckmaster, a video specialist from
10			
11		12	Discovery Video Services Incorporated in
		13	association with Wilcox & Fetzer. Counsel
12		14	will now introduce themselves and the
13		15	reporter will swear in the witness.
14		1	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
15		16	MR, ALLINGHAM: Tom Allingham
18		17	representing the plaintiffs. With me is
17		18	Brian Lenhard and Richard Horvath.
		19	MR. SHAU: Jarrod Shau representing
18		ľ	• •
		20	the defendants.
19			
19 20		21	DR. MARK A. ISAACS,
19 20 21		21	
19 20 21 22		21 22	HAVING FIRST BEEN DULY SWORN, TESTIFIED AS FOLLOWS:
19 20 21		21	

A. Well, according to this, it gives any board member the opportunity to express and pray to whoever they want and however they want. So, to answer that question, I would say yes.

Q. Your answer spoke to terms of reviewing text of the policy and interpreting the policy. My question had to do with comments by board members during the consideration of the policy.

Did any board member ever say, in words or substance, "We should adopt this policy because it safeguards the rights of individual board members to pray as they see fit."?

A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

- Q. And when you say no, do you mean, "No, I remember that that was never said," or "No, I don't recall that that was ever said."?
- A. No, I don't recall any board member specifically saying, "Adopt this so we can pray."
- 19 Q. Paragraph three of the policy reads, quote, 20 "Such opportunity." And that opportunity is the 21 opportunity to open the meeting with a prayer;
- 22 correct, or a moment of silence?
- 23 A. (Nodding head)
 - "Such opportunity shall not be used or

I say enforce, that may have caused you to think about

- 2 police officers. I meant was it the board members
- 3 themselves who had the obligation to enforce this
- 4 limitation?

1

5

6

7

- A. Yes.
- Q. Now, do you recall any prayer that was offered that you viewed as either violating paragraph
- three or raising a question about whether it violated 8 9 paragraph three at anytime during your tenure after
- 10 the adoption of this policy?
- 11 No, not really, because, you know, my 12 interpretation of it was that each board member had the opportunity to express as they felt fit as long as 13 14 it wasn't used to promote any one particular religion, 15 so, no, I don't remember any specific board prayer
- 16 that was more offensive or less offensive or anything
- 17 like that.
- 18 Q. I am going to offer -- I am going to give you 19 an example of a prayer that -- Well, I will let you 20 make the judgment, but I am going to give you a prayer
- 21 and ask you if it would have been given it would have 22 violated the policy. Okay?
- 23 "Oh, Lord, please convert the Jews in the 24

audience and ensure that they come to know our Lord

37

exploited to proselytize, advance or convert anyone or to derogate or otherwise disparage any particular faith or belief."

Would you agree with me that that paragraph imposes some limitations on the right of board members to pray as they see fit?

- A. Yes.
- Q. And that was a limitation that you, as a board member, thought was appropriate to include in 10 the policy?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. What did you understand in the context of 13 this paragraph the prohibition against proselytizing 14
- 15 A. I guess my interpretation of it would be that you cannot use that opportunity to advance or promote 16 17 any one particular religion over another.
- 18 Q. Who had the responsibility to ensure that 19 that limitation was complied with?
- 20 A. I would assume that it would be left up to 21 the individual giving the prayer. I mean there wasn't 22 a police officer there to enforce anything or anything 23 like that.
- 24 Q. I know you weren't being facetious, and when

Jesus Christ,"

2

4

- A. Yes, it would.
- 3 Q. That would violate paragraph three?
 - A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Now, suppose that a board member gave that
- prayer which would violate, in your view, paragraph 6
- 7 three. What would be done? What would be the
- 8 response of the board?
- 9 A. As far as repercussions, you mean, or?
- 10 Q. Yes, if any?
- A. I would assume that there would be dialogue 11
- that would take place, probably in executive session, 12
- 13 to ask one of the board members why did you do that or
- why did you say those words or --14
- 15 Q. I purposely picked that extreme example so we 16 could explore what the board would do. I could ask
- 17 you what you would have done. That's an example that
- seems to you to be a clear violation of paragraph 18
- 19 three. Would you have brought that to the president
- 20 or the individual board member's attention yourself?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And I take it what you would have done is to
 - say, "I believe that prayer was in violation of our
- 24 policy." Correct?

40

1	A. Yes.	1
2	Q. At that point the horse would be out of the	2
3	barn; right?	3
4	A. Right.	4
5	Q. On that prayer?	5
6	A. Right.	6
7	 Q. Would you suggest that that person be taken 	7
8	out of the rotation to offer prayers thereafter, or do	8
9	you think	9
10	A. No, I am not a one-strike man, so I would	10
11	give them the opportunity to redeem themself.	11
12	Q. Okay. And if the board member then offered a	12
13	prayer, you know, "Convert the heathens in the	13
14	audience, please, Lord," you would at that point two	14
15	strikes is enough?	15
16	A. Yeah.	16
17	Q. You wouldn't give them a third chance?	17
18	A. Right.	18
19	MR. ALLINGHAM: Okay. We are going to	19
20	change the tape.	20
21	THE WITNESS: Okay.	21
22	VIDEOGRAPHER: Going off the record at	22
23	2:34 p.m.	23
24	(A recess was taken.)	24
	<i>1</i> 1	i

In your judgment as a board member, would that prayer be permitted or be prohibited by paragraph three of the policy? A. It's not nondenominational. Q. But the policy doesn't require that a prayer be nondenominational. The policy simply requires that the prayer not be used or exploited to proselytize, advance or convert anyone or to derogate or otherwise disparage any particular faith. So, in light of that, would you view this as --A. No, I would not view this as bad. Q. It would be permitted under paragraph three? Q. And, to put it in the language of paragraph three, you would not view that prayer as --A. Proselytizing. Q. -- proselytizing? A. No, sir. Q. This prayer has been marked as PX45. It reads, "Heavenly Father, thank you for this great

occasion, for the work, the effort, the joys and everything that led up to this point in time.

Thank you for your guidance in this event. We pray

for your direction in the lives of each of these

41

43

VIDEOGRAPHER: Going back on the 1 record at 2:39 p.m. 2 3 BY MR. ALLINGHAM:

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

Q. Dr. Isaacs, I am going to show you a second prayer, and this one is long, so I am going to give it to you in writing. We have previously marked this as PX35. I will read it into the record, but follow

along as we go. "Do not put your trust in princes, in mortal men who cannot even save themselves. When their spirit departs, they return to the ground. On that very day, their plans come to nothing. Blessed is he whose help is the God of Jacob, whose hope is in the

Lord, his God, the maker of heaven and earth, the sea, and everything in them, the Lord who remains faithful forever. He upholds the cause of the oppressed and

17 gives food to the hungry. The Lord sets prisoners

free. The Lord gives sight to the blind. The Lord 18 19

lifts up those who are bowed down. The Lord loves the righteous. The Lord watches over the alien and

20 21 sustains the fatherless and the widow, but he

22 frustrates the ways of the wicked. For the wages of

23 sin is death, but the gift of God is eternal life 24

through Jesus Christ our Lord."

1 school board members. We pray that you direct them 2 into the truth and eventually the truth that comes by 3 knowing Jesus. We also pray that you would be with 4 them at this time. We ask these things in Jesus's 5 name. Amen." 6

Do you view that prayer as proselytizing?

A. No. It's not nondenominational, but no.

Q. You have said that several times. Do I correctly infer from that that, as a board member, you would have preferred that the prayers that are offered to open a meeting be nondenominational?

A. I think everybody should be free to express how they choose to do so, so I would say it's a matter of interpretation. I mean this goes in accordance with what would be number three, any such prayer may be sectarian or non-sectarian, so it's following the policy, I guess, is what I am saying, but.

17 18 Q. Let me ask you this question: Is it possible 19 for a prayer to be sectarian, that is directed to a

particular deity, and at the same time not be 20 21 proselytizing?

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

22 A. I guess when I think of proselytizing, I am 23 thinking of someone standing up at the pulpit saying,

"You will do this or this is the way you should go or 24

1 your attention to those words? 1 obviously by comments of the general public, but. 2 A. No. 2 Q. Did you understand, Dr. Isaacs, that that was 3 Q. Halfway through the second page there is a a widely held view of the public? I am not talking of 3 4 whereas clause that talks about the American Civil 4 the board members now, I am talking about the public. 5 Liberties Union. Do you have any recollection of a 5 A. I wouldn't say -- I would not say it's a 6 discussion of the American Civil Liberties Union 6 widely held view. I would just say it was a view. 7 during the discussion of this school board prayer? 7 Q. Which you heard from more than one person? 8 A. You mean by board? 8 A. Right. 9 Q. Yes, by board members. 9 Q. These are hard things to remember, but can 10 A. No, but I know that the public felt American 10 you estimate the number of people who said that to you in words or substance? Are we talking a dozen? 11 Civil Liberties Union -- I mean there is a sentiment 11 there that the ACLU is taking away rights of people by 12 12 A. No. 13 the general public. But no, not that I recall. 13 Q. A hundred? Q. So you don't recall any discussion at the 14 14 A. No. 15 board level or at the Policy Committee -- I guess I am 15 Q. Two? 16 just going to assume you weren't at Policy Committee 16 A. No, no, no, not even five. If it didn't have 17 meetings. Okay? 17 something to do with athletics or why the budget was 18 A. Yes, that's a good assumption. 18 overspent, they were the main substance of what I was 19 Q. Do you recall a discussion of any kind at the 19 dealing with. 20 board level of the involvement of the ACLU in this 20 Q. The next clause on page two reads, "Whereas 21 litigation? 21 the board has obtained the legal advice of two 22 A. Well, yes, I remember, if I am not mistaken, 22 competent and experienced constitutional attorneys, 23 that one of the board minutes add that there was 23 John W. Whitehead, Esquire, and Thomas S. Neuberge 24 someone there from the ACLU that actually spoke, if I 24 Esquire, that prayer to open board meetings is 53 55 1 am not mistaken, but. constitutional in the United States Court of Appeals 1 2 Q. Your memory is accurate. Do you recall the 2 for the Third Circuit, which includes Delaware, and 3 name of Dru Fennel? legal counsel have identified the following legal 3 4 A. No. 4 authority in support of their legal opinion." 5 Q. Was the person who spoke a woman? 5 Do you recall having read something to that 6 A. Yes. 6 effect at anytime during your consideration of the 7 Q. And did she speak at a meeting at which 7 board prayer policy? 8 Mrs. Dobrich also spoke? 8 A. No, I don't. 9 A. Good question. 9 Q. Is it correct that the school board obtained 10 Q. That was a statement by a representative of 10 the legal advice of two confident and experienced 11 the ACLU. Do you recall discussions by board member 11 constitutional attorneys that prayer to open board 12 of the ACLU's involvement in this litigation? 12 meetings is constitutional? A. Um, maybe just questioning whether they were 13 13 A. I know a lot of questions were asked. 14 involved in it, but no lengthy deliberation about 14 Whether you would say that you got their legal advice

15 anything like that. 16 Q. Let me come back to your statement about the

17 public. Do you understand or did you understand when 18 you were on the board that the public viewed the

19 board's defense of this lawsuit as a defense of

20 Christian values?

21 A. Some did.

22 Q. How did you find that out? Did they tell you

23 that?

24 A. I am sure just in grocery stores and I mean 15 from it, according to this, yes.

16 Q. When you say "a lot of questions were asked," 17 you mean questions were asked by board members of

18 Mr. Neuberger? 19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And did Mr. Neuberger respond?

21

22 Q. And is the substance of his response

23 reflected in this memorandum prepared by

56

24 Mr. Neuberger?

Unsigned

McCabe, Elaine (Video) 10/17/2006 9:02:00 AM

	VI//# TT		
	NATIONAL DESCRIPTION OF A STATE O	1	
1 2	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT IN AND FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE	1	
3	MONA DOBRICH and MARCO : Case No. 15-120	2	
_	DOBRICH, Individually and :	3	TABLE OF CONTENTS
4	as parents and next friend : of ALEXANDER DOBRICH, :	4	TESTIMONY OF ELAINE MCCABE:
5	SAMANTHA DOBRICH, JANE DOE:	1	
	and JOHN DOE, Individually :	5	Direct Examination by Mr. Horvath 4
6	and as parents and next : friend of JORDAN DOE and ;	6	Certificate of Reporter
7	JAMIE DOE.	7	
	;	8	
8	Plaintiffs, :		
9	v. :	9	
	;	10	INDEX TO EXHIBITS
10	INDIAN RIVER SCHOOL :	11	Plaintiff's Exhibit 57
11	DISTRICT, et al., :	12	,
•	Defendants, :		
12	17 H H H H H H	13	
13	Video Deposition of ELAINE MCCABE, taken pursuant to notice, on Tuesday, October 17, 2006	14	
14	at 9:02 a.m. at 31 Hosier Street, Selbyville,	15	
	Delaware, reported by Lorena J. Hartnett, a Registered		
15 16	Professional Reporter and Notary Public.	16	
17	APPEARANCES:	17	
18	RICHARD HORVATH, ESQUIRE	18	
19	BRIAN G. LENHARD, ESQUIRE Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom	19	
19	One Rodney Square		
20	Wilmington, DE 19801	20	•
21	Attorneys for the Plaintiff	21	
22	WILCOX & FETZER	22	
	1330 King Street - Wilmington, DE 19801	23	
23	(302) 655-0477 www.wilfet.com		
24	TH HATTIMENT CONT.	24	
		2	4
		2 1	(The videographer read the
1			
2	APPEARANCES (CONTINUED):	2	Introduction, and the attorneys introduced
3	JASON P. GOSSELIN, ESQUIRE	3	themselves.)
	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP	4	ELAINE MCCABE,
4	One Logan Square	5	HAVING FIRST BEEN DULY SWORN, TESTIFIED AS FOLLOWS:
	18th and Cherry Streets		
5	Philadelphia, PA 19103-6996	6	DIRECT EXAMINATION ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFFS
	Attorney for the Defendants	7	BY MR. HORVATH:
6		8	Q. Good morning, Ms. McCabe.
		9	A. Good morning.
7			
8		10	Q. Just so I can be clear from the start, is it
9		11	Ms. or Mrs.?
10		12	A. Mrs.
11		1	
12		13	Q. Mrs. Have you ever been deposed before?
13		14	A. Once, yes.
14		15	Q. And what was that, what were you What case
		16	was that?
15		۱ , ،	
			A. It was the Barkaski case associated with the
16		17	
		17 18	school district,
16		1	school district. Q. And what was the nature of that case?
16 17		18 19	Q. And what was the nature of that case?
16 17 18 19		18	
16 17 18 19 20		18 19	Q. And what was the nature of that case?
16 17 18 19 20 21		18 19 20	Q. And what was the nature of that case? A. It was a case that involved missing monles
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	•	18 19 20 21 22	Q. And what was the nature of that case? A. It was a case that involved missing monles from a booster organization. Q. Okay, did that case proceed to trial?
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23		18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. And what was the nature of that case? A. It was a case that involved missing monies from a booster organization. Q. Okay, did that case proceed to trial? A. No.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	•	18 19 20 21 22	Q. And what was the nature of that case? A. It was a case that involved missing monles from a booster organization. Q. Okay, did that case proceed to trial?

McCabe, Elaine (Video) 10/17/2006 9:02:00 AM

1	just want to understand how you view this prayer to
2	operate under the policy.

Case 1:05-cv-00120-JJF

A. Okay.

3

4

5

6

- Q. So I am going to show you what has previously been marked PX45.
- A. Okay.
- 7 Q. "Heavenly Father, thank you for this great 8 occasion, for the work, the effort, the joys, and everything that led up to this point in time.
- 9 10 Thank you for your guidance in this event. We pray
- 11 for your direction in the lives of each of these
- 12 school board members. We pray that you direct them to
- 13 the truth and eventually the truth that comes by
- 14 knowing Jesus. We also pray that you would be with
- 15 them at this time. We ask these things in Jesus's 16 name. Amen."

17 Do you believe that this prayer would violate 18 paragraph three of the policy?

19 A. No.

24

9

15

- 20 Q. Is this prayer asking that the board members 21 be directed into the truth and eventually the truth
- that comes by knowing Jesus? 22
- 23 A. Yes, I believe it is.
 - Q. Do you think that's trying to influence the

1 A. Okay.

3

7

9

16

- 2 Q. "Allah, we offer you our school bus drivers,
 - we offer you our superintendent, our administrators
- 4 and our secretaries. We offer you our teachers and
- 5 our parents. Finally, we offer you our students.
- 6 Peace be unto your prophet, Muhammed."
 - A. What do you mean by offer you?
- 8 Q. How do you understand that?
 - A. I don't. I am not sure that I do understand
- 10 it, because it's not a prayer that I am used to
- 11 hearing. If it's just -- If by saying "we offer you,"
- meaning please take care of or please oversee or care 12
- 13 for, then I have no objections to it.
- 14 Q. What if it said, in place of offer, "we lift
- 15 up to you"?
- 17 Q. How do you understand "lift up to you" to 18
 - mean?
- 19 A. Um, again I guess I would see it as being
- 20 here to accept a higher being's guidance.
- Q. Suppose you are in the audience if such a 21
- 22 prayer were offered.
- 23 A. Uh-huh, that prayer?

A. That's fine.

24 Q. This prayer.

6

83

1 board members?

- 2 A. No.
- Q. Why not? 3
- 4 A. Well, because if a board member sat at a
- board meeting and gave this prayer at the beginning, 5
- then I am sitting there as a board member either open 6
- 7 to his prayer because of what, because I have similar
- beliefs, or I am sitting there respecting his right to 8
- say, or her right to say the prayer, but, if it's not 10 my thing, I may be sitting there just quietly
- reflecting, but I am not influenced by him giving this 11 12
- Q. Do you think your impression of this prayer 13 14 might be biased because you are a Christian?
 - A. Oh, it could be.
- 16 Q. And you find nothing in this prayer that 17 proselytizes?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Nothing that's trying to influence or force 20 someone to change their religious faith?
- 21 A. Not me. I mean I can't speak for other 22 people that hear this, but it would not me.
- 23 Q. Okay. I have another one which I am just 24 going to read.

- A. Okay. 1
- 2 Q. And I am going to assume as a parent or other 3 member of the community you wouldn't see yourself as
- 4 one of these individuals listed under the prayer. How
- 5 would you feel as a Christian hearing a board member

 - offering or lifting you up to Allah?
- 7 A. I would not object to it. And let me just
- 8 add to that. I don't mean to keep referring to it,
- 9 but as I have indicated to you, I have been through
- 10 some personal crisis lately. I have actually had a 11
 - house that my brother, sister and I owned burn down
 - through a construction accident out on our property.
- 12 13 I lost my father December 12 of 2005. I lost
- 14 my mother January 4 of 2005, 22 days after my father, 15 and I lost a 20 year old nephew February 25, and I
- 16 frankly have appreciated every prayer that everyone
- 17 has offered up in my parents' name and my name, and
- 18 from customers where I work and people that I know
- 19 that some of them are not Christians and of the same 20 faith, but I have been thankful and grateful for any
- 21 prayer that they have given me, because it just simply
- 22 means they care about me, and I would not object to
- 23 that prayer.
- 24 And if there was a board member elected that

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

23

24

was of another faith, I would respect their prayer any night they gave it, the same way I respected the ones that were given the 11 years I was on the board.

Now, I have chosen personally not to attend church after my children were grown, but, and I am not going to tell you that I ever prayed, that I always prayed every time someone at a board meeting gave a prayer, but what I can tell you is that I was quiet and I respected the prayer that they gave.

Probably the only ones that I would have objected to strongly would be ones that proposed some of the crazy things going on in our world today where prayer is associated and faith and religion is associated with causing people harm and doing crazy, wild things in the name of the faith.

- Q. So, you know, if a prayer -- The only prayer that you would find objectionable is if someone stood up and said, "We pray that the heathens in our midst come to know you and, if they don't, we are going to behead them."?
- 21 A. Uh-huh, yeah, I would have objected to that 22 one.
- 23 Q. Would, short of that threat of physical 24 violence --

1 practice of opening its meetings with prayer an issue 2 in the 2006 election?

- 3 A. 2006? Last May, I think there were three or 4 four elections, if I am not mistaken. I am sure it 5 was an issue for some people. There were other 6 issues, I think, just as important.
 - Q. You stated that if a board member gave a prayer that you may not agree with personally, that you would remain quiet and respectful while they give the prayer. Am I correct in that?
 - A. What do you mean not agree with?
- 12 Q. If someone gave a prayer of a different 13 religious faith than yours, --
- 14 A. Uh-huh.

7

8

9

10

11

- 15 Q. -- you would allow them to make the prayer 16 and remain quiet and respectful of them while
- 17 they were giving the prayer?
- 18 A. Yes. 19 Q. Do you think everyone in attendance should do
- 20 the same? 21 A. Well, we can't really control what the
- 22 audience does. I think the board members should, and
- 23 I think the board members would, but even with the

24 prayers that are given, frankly most of the time there

85

87

- 1 A. No, I am not saying short of that. I am just 2 saying that, you know, if people prayed to someone else besides God or Jesus, I would have respected that 3 4 right.
- 5 Q. Has, to your knowledge, has anyone served on 6 the board that was not a Christian?
- 7 A. I have no idea. It's not an issue that I 8 have ever been aware of, and I have never questioned 9 what religious background any of the board members 10
- 11 Q. Do you believe that someone who openly 12 professes the Muslim faith could be elected to the 13 school board?
- A. Oh, probably not in this area, not right now. 14 15 I think that day will come, but I don't think.
- 16 Q. In the foreseeable future could that day 17 come?
- A. Probably in my children's lifetime, I think. 18 19 I am not sure whether it will in my lifetime. I think 20 it would be much more likely for someone of the Jewish 21 faith to be elected to the school board, but I don't 22 know that religion has ever been an issue in a school

board election as politics or parties or not, either.

Q. Was the board prayer issue -- Was the board's

- are people in the audience talking while it's going 1 2 on, and we don't -- We don't and can't really control
- 3 that.

6

- 4 Q. Can the board president call the meeting to 5 order? Can he --
 - A. Yes.
- 7 Q. -- insist that the meeting be conducted 8 orderly?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. If there was a disruption in the audience,
- 11 could the board president clear the room?
- 12 A. Well, you know, I suppose by procedures of
- 13 how to operate a meeting, he could. I have never
- 14 known it to happen, and I don't know how he would do 15
 - it, really, she.
- 16 Q. But you could see the board maintaining some
- 17 degree of order if there was a disruption?
- 18 A. I think the board president tries to, by
- 19 beating the gavel or whatever, tries to maintain
- 20 order, yes, as much as they can.
- 21 Q. To go back to your statement about,
- 22 instructing me that you would have to see the prayer
- 23 being really strong before you would find it
- 24 objectionable, so let me just read you one last one?

	h, et al. Mitchell	v. Case No. 15-120	Indian Ríver School District, et al. October 16, 2006
			Page 1
1	IN THE UNIT	ED STATES DISTRI	CT COURT
2	IN AND FOR	THE DISTRICT OF	DELAWARE
3	MONA DOBRICH and MA	RCO : Cas	e No. 15-120 (JJF)
	DOBRICH, Individual	ly and :	
4	as parents and next		
	of ALEXANDER DOBRIC	•	
5	SAMANTHA DOBRICH, J		!
	and JOHN DOE, Indiv	-	
6	and as parents and		
~	friend of JORDAN DO	E and :	
7	JAMIE DOE,	•	1
8	Plaintiff	· s. :	• •
J		:	
9	v.	:	1
_		;	1
10	INDIAN RIVER SCHOOL	;	1
	DISTRICT, et al.,	:	1
11		:	
	Defendants	s. :	
12	• •		
13	~		A MITCHELL, taken
	pursuant to notice,		
14	at 9:15 a.m. at 31 l)
1 5	Delaware, reported Professional Reporte		•
15 16	Professional Report	er and Notary rus	!
17	APPEARANCES:	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	
18		LINGHAM, ESQUIRE	l
		ORVATH, ESQUIRE	
19	One Rodney		l
	Wilmington	n, DE 19801	
20	Attorne	eys for the Plair	ntiff
21			
22		LCOX & FETZER	
	-	eet - Wilmington,	DE 19801
23		(302) 655-0477	
0.4	V.	www.wilfet.com	
24			
Wilcox 8	k Fetzer, Ltd. Profe	essional Court Reporters	(302)655-0477

1	that I had been abusive in any way in the deposition?	1	A. Nobody asked me in particular. My friends
2	A. No, they did not.	2	encouraged me, because the person who held the seat
3	Q. Or harassing?	3	was moving out of the district.
4	A. No.	4	Q. Who was that?
5	Q. Or belittling in tone?	5	A. Elaine McCabe.
6	A. No.	6	Q. And whom did you notify that you intended to
7	Q. What did you do to prepare for the	7	run for the school board? What's the official process
8	deposition? Did you meet with your lawyers?	8	for putting your name on the ballot?
9	A. Yes.	9	A. You go to Georgetown and you put your name in
10	Q. And when did that take place?	10	to get on the ballot.
11	A. I don't remember the exact date.	11	Q. What district do you represent?
12	Q. The exact date is not Within the last	12	A. District 5.
13	couple of weeks?	13	Q. During the campaign or during let's just call
14	A. Yes.	14	it the period of time running up to the election, did
15	Q. Alright, and is that a meeting that took	15	you make any special effort to connect with voters,
16	place in this room?	16	explain your positions, find out their concerns and so
17	A. Yes.	17	forth?
18	Q. And who was here?	18	A. Actually, I didn't do anything formal. I,
19	A. Myself, Nina Lou, Janet, the secretary, Janet	19	you know, worked with the people; I go to church with
20	Hearn, and Jason, and two of his associates.	20	the people; I have lived in this community my entire
21	Q. Over the course of that meeting, did you	21	life; so, of course, I have conversations, but nothing
22	review any documents?	22	formal.
23	A. I had no documents before me.	23	Q. Was that because you felt that people
24	Q. Did any of the lawyers read to you from any	24	understood where you stood on the issues?
	9	ļ	11
1	documents?	1	A. Yes.
1 2	A. I don't remember documents being read. It	2	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you
	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect,	2 3	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening
2 3 4	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition.	2 3 4	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer?
2 3 4 5	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that	2 3 4 5	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes.
2 3 4 5 6	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to	2 3 4 5 6	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer?A. Yes.Q. What was that position?
2 3 4 5 6 7	 A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events 	2 3 4 5 6 7	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	 Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life? A. I have always lived in this area. It's just	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe it solemnizes the proceedings and prepares people to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life? A. I have always lived in this area. It's just that I was born at the hospital in Lewes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe it solemnizes the proceedings and prepares people to conduct the business of the district.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life? A. I have always lived in this area. It's just that I was born at the hospital in Lewes. Q. When you ran for the school board, did you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe it solemnizes the proceedings and prepares people to conduct the business of the district. Q. Anything else? Any other reason for your
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life? A. I have always lived in this area. It's just that I was born at the hospital in Lewes. Q. When you ran for the school board, did you prepare any campaign materials, posters, handouts,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe it solemnizes the proceedings and prepares people to conduct the business of the district. Q. Anything else? Any other reason for your belief?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life? A. I have always lived in this area. It's just that I was born at the hospital in Lewes. Q. When you ran for the school board, did you prepare any campaign materials, posters, handouts, anything like that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe it solemnizes the proceedings and prepares people to conduct the business of the district. Q. Anything else? Any other reason for your belief? A. No, I think that says it.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life? A. I have always lived in this area. It's just that I was born at the hospital in Lewes. Q. When you ran for the school board, did you prepare any campaign materials, posters, handouts, anything like that? A. Nothing.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe it solemnizes the proceedings and prepares people to conduct the business of the district. Q. Anything else? Any other reason for your belief? A. No, I think that says it. Q. Okay. You would agree with me that not
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life? A. I have always lived in this area. It's just that I was born at the hospital in Lewes. Q. When you ran for the school board, did you prepare any campaign materials, posters, handouts, anything like that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe it solemnizes the proceedings and prepares people to conduct the business of the district. Q. Anything else? Any other reason for your belief? A. No, I think that says it.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. I don't remember documents being read. It was more preparing us for kind of what to expect, because we had never been to a deposition. Q. Did anything occur at that meeting that refreshed your recollection about events relating to the school board prayer issue, particularly the events of the summer and fall of 2004? A. No, I don't believe we even discussed that. Q. Where were you born, Ms. Mitchell? A. Lewes, Delaware. Q. And did you attend public schools in the Lewes area? A. No, I did not. I attended this school that we are sitting in for 12 years. Q. All right, so you moved to this area early on in your life? A. I have always lived in this area. It's just that I was born at the hospital in Lewes. Q. When you ran for the school board, did you prepare any campaign materials, posters, handouts, anything like that? A. Nothing.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. Before you were elected to the board, did you have a position on the appropriateness of opening school board meetings with a prayer? A. Yes. Q. What was that position? A. I believe that it's okay to do so. Q. And what was the basis for that belief? And this is before you joined the board; this is at the time that you were running for the school board in 2005. A. It has been tradition to open school board meetings with prayer. My grandfather was on the school board when I was a young child in school, and they opened the meetings with prayer at that time, and that's over 50 years ago. It's always been done that way, and I believe it solemnizes the proceedings and prepares people to conduct the business of the district. Q. Anything else? Any other reason for your belief? A. No, I think that says it. Q. Okay. You would agree with me that not

1 correct? We can think of bad examples?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

16

17

hand?

Q. Or, to say it a different way, some

traditions are good and some traditions are bad? Fair enough?

A. Fair enough.

Q. This one, though, seems to you to be a good tradition?

A. Yes.

Q. Why does it seem to you to be a good

A. I see no harm in it, and I only see good in it, because I think it prepares people to settle down to be serious about what is going to take place.

And, as a Christian personally, it makes me feel that I am more prepared because I am asking for wisdom in making decisions that are important that are going to affect the school district. That's my personal opinion.

Q. And some of what we will talk about today is your personal opinion and then the sort of broader impact of the open prayer.

But in your earlier answer you said it prepared -- I may not have the words quite right, but the opinion that you have just expressed today, that the impact of the prayer is limited to the ten board members?

A. I can't really say. It's just the way I feel about it.

Q. You testified several times using the word solemnizing. You know that that word is in the policy, itself?

A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

Q. Would you tell me, and maybe you have already answered this question in part, maybe entirely, but would you tell me what you think it means when the policy says "in order to solemnify its proceedings"?

A. To me, it means to get serious, solemn, to bring us together as a body, as a legislative body to conduct business.

Q. Do you think it's necessary for the, in order for the board members to get serious and to bring the board members together as a legislative body, for the board to open its meetings with a prayer?

21 A. Do I think it's necessary?

Q. Correct.

23 A. I think it's preferable.

Q. Preferable but not necessary?

it prepares people to settle down for the business at

A. It solemnizes it. It makes us get more serious and settles us.

Q. Okay. And in each of those sentences, the object of the settling or the solemnization, you use the pronoun "us," and what I would like to know is who is it, precisely, that the prayer is directed to?

A. The school board.

Q. All right. Is it intended that it has any impact whatsoever on the members of the public who ar in attendance, or is it limited to the school board

13 members who have to make decisions at that meeting? 14 A. In my opinion, it's limited to the school

15 board members.

Q. And was that your view when you were running for the school board in 2005?

18 A. I never thought about it at that time. It 19 was not an issue.

20 Q. And, by the way, that's a perfectly good 21 answer. Don't feel like you have to have an answer to 22 every question.

23 A. Right. 24

Q. So what caused you to think about it and form

A. To me, it's extremely important.

Q. I can ask -- I can keep asking the question, but -- I could ask the question a different way, but I am going to persist until I get an answer from you or an answer that you can't answer.

15

Do you think it's necessary for the Board of Education of the Indian River School District to open its meetings with a prayer in order for those members to get serious and to bring them together as a legislative body?

A. In my personal opinion, we would not be as effective if we did not do so.

13 Q. And why is that?

> A. Because I believe asking the Lord's direction and guidance is extremely important when you come to matters that are discussed of such importance.

Q. Let me pursue that a moment. So, in your personal perspective -- Let me strike that.

19 It's your goal, I assume, always to make the 20 best possible decisions you can as a school board 21 member?

22 A. Correct.

23 Q. And it's your belief that the ten members of 24 the school board will make better decisions if they

a prayer in your head seeking divine guidance, just as you do at the special board meetings; is that right?

- A. I am listening to the prayer that's being said and I am also on my own, yes.
- Q. Fair enough. Paragraph three provides, "Such opportunity." That's the opportunity to offer a prayer, a moment of silence? Yes? That's what it refers to?
 - A. Okay, yes.

Q. "Such opportunity shall not be used or exploited to proselytize, advance or convert anyone or to derogate or otherwise disparage any particular faith or belief."

Is it your understanding that that limits, imposes some limits on what people can say when they offer a prayer or a moment of silence?

 A. I wouldn't think it would affect a moment of silence.

- 19 Q. That's a good point.
 - A. But it would have an affect on perhaps what would be said verbally.
 - Q. I have some -- I have some examples, and I want to, as a board member, I want to try to ask you whether you think these examples would violate

A. Right.

- Q. So that prayer that I have just offered you,
 whether it's appropriate or inappropriate, is it your
 view that it violates paragraph three of the board
 policy?
 - A. Would you say it again?
 - Q. Sure. And I am not going to promise I am going to get exactly the same words. I should have it written down somewhere. "Oh, Lord, we pray that you will convert the heathen in our audience so that they come to know the goodness and wisdom of your heart." Would that violate or be permitted under paragraph --
 - A. I would not say that. I would say it's really pushing the limit. It's -- I would not say that.
- Q. When you say "pushing the limit," you mean
 pushing the limit of things that are permitted under
 paragraph three; correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay, and what is it in that prayer that youthink would violate some provision of paragraph three?
 - A. We are not out to convert anyone.
- Q. Are you sure that that prayer would violateparagraph three, at least as you understand?

paragraph three or would be permitted under paragraph three.

And the first example I want to give you is suppose that a prayer was offered in which the person offering the prayer said, "Lord, we pray that you convert the heathen in our audience that they will come to know the goodness and wisdom of your heart."

Would you view that as a prayer that was permissible under paragraph three or violated paragraph three?

- A. I would think that would be inappropriate for a school board to say that, because we are praying for wisdom for our group, not for the audience. We are not trying to convert anyone.
- Q. That's helpful, and that's -- but it's -- I am looking for an answer to my specific question. You have before you a policy of the board. The board are the people charged with enforcing the board's policies; correct?
- 20 A. Right.
- Q. So you, as a board member, are charged with ensuring that nobody offers a prayer that is used or exploited to proselytize, advance or convert anyone and so forth; correct?

A. I can't speak for anyone else. It wouldn't be right for me, because our purpose is not to convert anyone. It's to seek wisdom in making business decisions.

Q. Understood, and I think you and I are in the same wavelength in that. I am now trying to get at something different. If anybody -- I know that you would not offer that prayer for the reasons you have just said, but if one of your colleagues offered that prayer and, just to make life a little easier for you, passed out the text ahead of time, would you form the conclusion that that was a prayer that would violate paragraph three of the policy?

- A. I would go to that person and say I don't think this is appropriate.
- Q. Because it violates paragraph three?
- A. More than paragraph three, it just isn't appropriate.

MR. ALLINGHAM: Okay. I am going to show you what we have previously marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 35. You don't have the stack in front of you. Do you want copies?

MR. GOSSELIN: I never did have this

one, because it was that little sheet that

1	individual board members to offer any prayer except
2	those that are used or exploited to proselytize,
3	advance or convert anyone or to derogate or otherwise
4	disparage any particular faith or belief: correct?

A. Yes.

12

13

20

24

1

2

7

10

- 5 6 Q. Okay. Am I right, then, at least in 7 understanding that you did not view the text of any 8 prayer that's been given since you joined the board as 9 having used or exploited the opportunity to pray, to 10 proselytize, advance or convert anyone, or to derogate 11 or otherwise disparage any particular faith or belief?
 - A. There haven't been any that have offended me or struck me that way.
- Q. On the other hand, that prayer that I gave 14 15 you a minute ago about converting the heathen, that 16 one would have struck you as being the use or 17 exploitation of the opportunity to proselytize,
- 18 advance or convert anyone and so forth; correct? 19 A. It certainly would push the limit. I just --
 - Q. You seem as though you are just not sure?
- 21 A. Well, no, I just --
- 22 Q. Let me give you another one. Suppose that 23 the prayer were --
 - MR. GOSSELIN: If you did it with the

wouldn't be my personal prayer.

- Q. And that would be true even if the text of that prayer, in your mind, would sound like an effort to convert someone?
- A. If I felt like something sounded like an effort to convert someone, I would speak up.
- 7 Q. Okay. And, similarly, the other words in 8 paragraph three, if it was an effort to proselytize, 9
 - A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

10

11

13

14

15

18

20

22

24

6

- Q. -- you would speak up?
- 12 A. That's not our place to do so.
 - Q. And so you would speak up if a board member offered prayer that you viewed as proselytizing?
 - A. Yes, I would.
- 16 Q. And describe for me -- I tried to give you an
- 17 example of a prayer that seemed clearly to try to
 - convert someone, because it said, "Help us, Lord, to
- 19 convert these people."
 - A. Right.
- 21 Q. But give me an example or tell me how you
 - would know that a prayer was seeking to proselytize?
- 23 A. I guess I would have to hear it. I don't
 - want to -- I can't think of an example right off the

113

115

- inflection that might come with it, that would tip her over the edge.
- 3 BY MR. ALLINGHAM:
- 4 Q. Suppose that the prayer were, "We pray, 5 Allah, that you convert the infidels in the public
- audience and on this board." 6
 - A. That would certainly get my attention.
- 8 Q. Wouldn't you think that was a prayer that was
- being used to try to convert someone? 9
 - A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Okay.
- 12 A. Or not, maybe not just convert, but to
- 13 slander or, or, I don't know what's the correct word
- to use. It would, for a Christian school district 14
- 15 overall, per say a majority, it would certainly catch
- 16 the attention of everyone, I am sure.
- 17 Q. But aren't these prayers supposed to be all
- 18 in accord with the freedom of conscience of the
- 19 individual adult board members?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. So --
- 22 A. I wouldn't -- I mean I would bring my prayer.
- 23 You know, I would -- I would -- I would give them the

114

right to say what they felt led to say, but it

- 1 top of my head, but I just don't think it's our place 2 to convert anyone to any religion.
- 3 Q. And proselytize is clearly different. It's a 4
- different clause here. You don't think it's your 5 place to proselytize for any particular religion?
 - A. No.
- 7 Q. Alright, now coming back to PX35, which is
- 8 the text of the prayer I gave you, --
- 9 A. Right.
- 10 Q. -- is it your view that this prayer
- 11 proselytizes?
- 12 A. It looks like the person will be reciting
- 13 scripture, and I can't get into their heads to know
- 14 why they would choose to cite scripture instead of
- 15 offering a prayer for wisdom. I don't know what their
- 16 intent would be. I just feel that it would be
- 17 inappropriate. I wouldn't do it, for me.
- 18 Q. This is not a prayer, though, that seeks to 19
 - convert someone, is it?
- 20 A. It doesn't sound like a prayer. It sounds
- 21 like scripture. It sounds like Romans.
- 22 Q. Part of it is Romans.
- 23 A. Okay, the end of it.
- 24 Q. Is it your view that for someone to quote

Unsigned

Case 1:05-cv-00120-JJF Document 265-3 Filed 05/08/2008 Page 25 of 59

Walls, Harvey 10/25/2006 4:42:00 PM

		- 1	
	1		
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE	1	MR. SHAU: I'm Jarrod Shau and I
3	FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE	2	represent the defendants in this action.
4	MONA DOBRICH and MARCO)	3	HARVEY L. WALLS,
-	DOBRICH, individually and)	4	the deponent herein, having first been
6	as perente and next friend) of ALEXANDER DOBRICH,)	1	•
6	SAMANTHA DOBRICH, JANE DOE)	5	duly sworn on oath, was examined and
_	and JOHN DOE, Individually)	6	testified as follows:
7	and as parents and next } friend of JORDAN DOE and)	7	BY MR. ALLINGHAM:
8	JAMIE DOE,		
		8	Q. Have you ever been deposed before, Mr. Walls?
8	Plaintiffs,) Civil Action	9	A. Yes.
10	v.) No. 05-120 (JJF)	10	Q. When?
)	11	A. I'm not sure of the date. Somewhere around
11	INDIAN RIVER SCHOOL,)	i	
12	DISTRICT, et al.,)	12	the late 90's for a district staff employee that had
	Defendants.)	13	sued the district.
13		14	Q. I am going to ask you some questions. Please
14	Videotaped Deposition of HARVEY L. WALLS, taken pursuant to notice at 31 Hosiar Street,	15	tell me if you don't understand the question or if you
15	Selbyville, Delaware, beginning at 1:30 p.m., on		
	Wadnesday, October 25, 2006, before Terry Barbano	16	think it's ambiguous,
16	Burke, RMR-CRR and Notary Public.	17	If you answer the question, I will
17 18	APPEARANCES: THOMAS ALLINGHAM, ESQUIRE	18	assume, and I think the judge and the jury will assume,
	BRIAN LENHARD, ESQUIRE	19	that you understood it. So let me know and I'll try to
19	One Rodney Square		·
20	Wilmington, Delaware 19801 For the Plaintiff	20	fix the question if you have a problem.
21		21	You have to answer out loud yes or no,
	WILCOX & FETZER	22	not uh-huh or uh-uh.
22	1330 King Street - Wilmington, Delaware 19801 (302) 655-0477	23	And leathy I freely confern that I tond
23	www.wilfet.com	1	And lastly, I freely confess that I tend
24		24	to interrupt people. I'll try not to do that. You
1	2 APPEARANCES (cont'd):	1	should try not to interrupt me or assume that you know
2			
4	JARROD SHAU, ESQUIRE	2	that what the answer to my question is, because the
-		2	that what the answer to my question is, because the
3	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP	3	court reporter can't take down both of us at once;
	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square		
3	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets	3	court reporter can't take down both of us at once;
	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996	3 4	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are?
3	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets	3 4 5 6	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No.
3	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants	3 4 5 6	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who
3 4 5	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996	3 4 5 6	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No.
3	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT:	3 4 5 6	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who
3 4 5	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS	3 4 5 6 7 8	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge,
3 4 5 6	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LL.P One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge. Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already
3 4 5 6 7 8	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist	3 4 5 6 7 8	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge,
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge. Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff	3 4 5 8 7 8 9	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge. Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your conversation, what did he say? A. Just basically that it went quite a long time.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m. The court reporter is Terry Burke from	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge. Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your conversation, what did he say? A. Just basically that it went quite a long time. Q. Anything else?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m. The court reporter is Terry Burke from the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer. My name is Mark	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your conversation, what did he say? A. Just basically that it went quite a long time.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m. The court reporter is Terry Burke from the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer. My name is Mark Buckmaster, a video specialist with Discovery Video	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge. Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your conversation, what did he say? A. Just basically that it went quite a long time. Q. Anything else?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m. The court reporter is Terry Burke from the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer. My name is Mark Buckmaster, a video specialist with Discovery Video Services, Incorporated, in association with Wilcox &	3 4 5 6 7 6 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge. Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your conversation, what did he say? A. Just basically that it went quite a long time. Q. Anything else? A. We talked about, a little bit about the type of stuff you might be covering or asking or something,
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m. The court reporter is Terry Burke from the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer. My name is Mark Buckmaster, a video specialist with Discovery Video Services, Incorporated, in association with Wilcox & Fetzer.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speek to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your conversation, what did he say? A. Just basically that it went quite a long time. Q. Anything else? A. We talked about, a little bit about the type of stuff you might be covering or asking or something, but exactly what I couldn't tell you.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m. The court reporter is Terry Burke from the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer. My name is Mark Buckmaster, a video specialist with Discovery Video Services, Incorporated, in association with Wilcox & Fetzer. Counsel will now introduce themselves and	3 4 5 6 7 6 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge. Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speak to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your conversation, what did he say? A. Just basically that it went quite a long time. Q. Anything else? A. We talked about, a little bit about the type of stuff you might be covering or asking or something, but exactly what I couldn't tell you. Q. Do you recall that Dr. Hattier told you any
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP One Logan Square 18th and Cherry Streets Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996 For the Defendants ALSO PRESENT: TIMOTHY KEARNS MARK BUCKMASTER, Video Specialist VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is the videotape deposition of Harvey L. Walls, taken by the plaintiff in the matter of Dobrich, et al., versus Indian River School District et al., Civil Action No. 05-120, held at 31 Hosier Street in Selbyville, Delaware, on October 25th, 2006, at approximately 1:32 p.m. The court reporter is Terry Burke from the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer. My name is Mark Buckmaster, a video specialist with Discovery Video Services, Incorporated, in association with Wilcox & Fetzer. Counsel will now introduce themselves and the reporter will swear in the witness.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	court reporter can't take down both of us at once; okay? Do you know who the Doe family are? A. No. Q. Has anyone ever told you that they know who the Doe family are? A. Not to my knowledge, Q. Have you spoken with anyone who has already given their deposition in this matter? A. I have spoken to Dr. Hattier and Mrs. Bunting. Q. When did you speek to Dr. Hattier? A. Oh, probably a week or two ago. Q. And what was the substance of your conversation, what did he say? A. Just basically that it went quite a long time. Q. Anything else? A. We talked about, a little bit about the type of stuff you might be covering or asking or something, but exactly what I couldn't tell you.

Walls, Harvey 10/25/2006 4:42:00 PM

- 1 supreme being, being Jehovah or Jesus or Buddha or
- 2 Allah and whatever. And sectarian I take to mean as
- 3 you can't, it would be basically a generality, only
- mentioning God and nothing else. 4
- 5 Q. All right. So taking that as the definition
- 6 of sectarian and non-sectarian, the prayers that were
- 7 offered over the 14 years of your service on the board,
- 8 were they sectarian or non-sectarian?
 - A. I would say 90 percent were probably
- 10 non-sectarian.
- 11 Q. Non-sectarian?
- 12 A. Yes.

9

- 13 Q. So would I be correct in understanding that
- 14 the board's practice over the 14 years of your tenure
- 15 was to offer non-sectarian prayers to open its
- 16 meetings?
- 17 A. I don't know that that was a practice. I
- 18 don't know that anyone in particular was told give
- 19 non-sectarian or sectarian prayer, to my knowledge.
- 20 Whoever gave the prayer gave the prayer however they
- 21 wanted to give it.
- Q. All right. 22
- 23 Who drafted BDA.1?
- 24 This was drafted by Tom Neuberger.

1 the policy?

8

9

18

22

2

4

8

15

Unsigned

2 A. It all depends on the type of policy that it

3 was. I mean sometimes the board would think that a

4 policy would be needed in a certain area and they would 5 make a recommendation to the policy committee and the

6 would then consider it, come back with a draft.

7 Other times it could be that the state,

department of education or federal education department would come down and say, you need to have a policy in

this area. Then it would go through a policy committee 10

and to the board. 11

12 Many times also it would go to the

13 district's lawyer before it would come to the board.

- 14 Q. Who was the district's lawyer in 2004?
- 15 James Griffin.
- 16 Q. Did this policy go to the district's lawyer?
- 17 A. I believe it did, but I can't say for sure.
 - Q. Well, in 2004, you were the president of the
- 19 board; correct?
- 20 A. I think so.
- 21 Q. And you were the head of the policy committee?
 - Α.
- 23 Q. Who would know better than you whether this
- 24 policy went to the district's lawyer before it went to

15

- 1 Q. How long did the policy committee consider the 2 board prayer policy before it presented the proposed 3 policy to the full board for first reading?
- 4 A. Just long enough to get it into draft form.
- 5 In other words, assigning the letters to it. 6

The actual wording in it was not left up to the policy committee. It was brought to the board

- 9 Q. Was the actual language of the board prayer 10 policy considered by the policy committee at any time?
- 11 A. No.

7

- 12 Q. How long did you serve on the policy
- 13 committee?
- 14 A. Out of 14 years, probably 11 or 12.
- 15 Q. Okay. Was there an ordinary process for the drafting, consideration and adoption of board policies? 16
- 17 A. The normal process would be it would come
- 18 through the policy committee and then from the policy
- committee to me or the policy committee chairman woul 19
- 20 bring it to the board.
- 21 Q. What was the normal process for drafting a
- 22 policy?
- A. Various. 23
- 24 Q. Tell me the ways that you went about drafting

- 1 the full board?
 - A. Probably a district administrator off the
- 3 policy committee that sent it to Mr. Griffin.
 - Q. Who would that be?
- 5 A. I don't know. It could be Mr. Savage or
- 6 Mrs. Bunting.
- 7 Q. That would be Susan Bunting?
- Q. How did it come about that the policy 9
- 10 committee undertook to consider a school board prayer
- 11 policy?
- 12 A. Because of the original complaint from
- 13 Mrs. Dobrich.
- 14 Q. And would you describe how that original
 - complaint was transmitted to, either to the board or to
- 16 the policy committee?
- 17 A. The original complaint I think had to do with
- 18 graduation services and baccalaureate services.
- 19 During, there was also a complaint at a public meeting
- 20 I think in August or so of that year about prayer at
- 21 board meetings. I believe that complaint came from the
- 22 ACLU representative who was there.
- 23 At that point, that's where the policy
- 24 committee got looking at three different areas of the 16

- Does that refresh your recollection that
- it was Mr. Helms who first contacted Mr. Neuberger?
- 4 A. It could have been.
 - Q. You still don't recollect?
- 6 A. I'm not sure.
- 7 Q. Did the board ever retain Mr. Neuberger or The
- 8 Rutherford Institute to represent it in connection with
- 9 this lawsuit and the issues presented?
- 10 A. Technically, no.
- 11 Q. And did Mr. Helms ever retain Mr. Neuberger to
- 12 represent him individually in connection with this
- 13 lawsuit?

3

5

- 14 A. I believe he did.
- 15 Q. And how do you know that Mr. Helms retained
- 16 Mr. Neuberger?
- 17 A. I believe he announced that to the board.
- 18 Q. Do you know whether Mr. Helms signed a
- retention agreement with Mr. Neuberger? 19
- 20 A. I would not know.
- Q. Is it your practice as board president when 21
- 22 you retain a lawyer or a law firm on the district's
- behalf to sign a retention agreement with that lawyer? 23
- A. The actual board president, no. It may very 24

- 1 paragraphs continuing over to the last page.
- 2 A. Uh-huh.

3

7

18

- Right.
- 4 Q. Are they substantively identical to the board
- 5 policy as adopted?
- 6 A. They are.
 - Q. Is this the document in which Mr. Neuberger
- 8 transmitted to you, apparently through Mr. Helms, the
- 9 text of the policy that you prepared to the board on
- 10 September 29th?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And is this the first time that this text was
- 13 transmitted to you from Mr. Neuberger?
- 14 A. I don't know.
- 15 Q. When you received this document, PX-34, did
- you review it? 16
- 17 A. Yes.
 - Q. Did you see anything in it that you thought
- 19 was inaccurate?
- A. I don't know about inaccuracies, but I believe 20
- 21 I recollect, after seeing it, my recommendation to the
- 22 board was the numbered items as policies on the last
- 23 two pages as the actual policy.
- 24 Q. Yes, sir. You recommended to the full

25

- well have been the superintendent. 1
- 2 Q. It is the practice of the district when it
- retains lawyers to execute a retention agreement; is 3
- 4 that right?
- 5 A. I believe so.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 Let me show you what's been marked as
- PX-34. 8
- 9 I gather that you have seen this
- 10 document?
- 11 A. I am sure I have.
- 12 Q. The first page reflects it was faxed from
- Mr. Helms to you on September 2nd, 2004; is that 13
- 14 correct?
- 15 A. That's what it says on the front.
- 16 Q. You have no reason to doubt that, do you?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. Looking at the content of the fax, do you
- recall having seen this document? 19
- 20 A. I am sure I have seen it. I just don't
- 21 necessarily remember it.
- Q. Look at the next to the last page of the 22
- 23 package which we have marked. Down at the bottom of
- the page, you will see that there are five numbered 26

- board ---1
- A. I did not recommend that all these other pages 2
- 3 be part of the policy.
- 4 Q. In making that recommendation and ultimately
- 5 voting to adopt policy BDA.1 on school board prayer,
- 6 did you take into consideration as one factor in your
- 7 decision the material provided by Mr. Neuberger in
- PX-34? 8
- 9 A. Well, obviously I considered the last two
- 10 pages.
- 11 Q. Yes, that seems clear. Did you also take into
- 12 account the materials provided in the first four pages
- 13 of the fax?
- 14 A. I certainly read them.
- 15 Q. And did you take them into account?
- 16
- 17 Q. The information provided was one of the
- factors that you considered in voting to adopt the 18
- policy; is that right? 19
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. On Page 2 of Mr. Neuberger's memo, about
- 22 two-thirds of the way down the page in the last whereas
- 23 clause on that page, PX-34 reflects, "The school board
- 24 has retained the legal advice" -- sorry. I'll start

Walls, Harvey 10/25/2006 4:42:00 PM

- 1 actual substance of the board policy, no, it was not
- 2 discussed at that meeting.
- 3 Q. Are most board policies discussed at a policy
- 4 committee meeting?
- A. Yes. 5
- 6 Q. Why was this one not discussed?
- 7 A. Because I did not want to subject the
- 8 administrators on the policy committee to any portion
- 9 of that policy because I figured -- I thought this was
- a policy completely affecting the board. 10
- Q. And only the board? 11
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And that's reflected in the first 13
- 14 sentence of Paragraph 4, "Such prayer is voluntary and
- 15 it is among only the adult members of the board"?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. I take it that it was your view that to
- 18 accomplish its purpose, that is, to solemnify its
- 19 proceedings, the board could accomplish that purpose t
- having a member open its meeting with a prayer;
- 21 correct?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. That would be an effective way to solemnify
- the proceedings? 24

A. Yes.

silence; correct?

A. Yes.

board; correct?

A. I'm sure I was.

A. I'm sure I did.

silence or the prayer?

A. I probably did.

A. Yes.

consisted of?

with a prayer or moment of silence?

Q. Did you have it written down?

A. That's correct.

solemnify the proceedings?

half, no. 1

5

7

13

- 2 Q. Did you have a piece of paper that you
- 3 brought, the piece of paper on which the disclaimer was
- written, that you took with you to each meeting --4
 - A. Yes.
- 6 Q. -- so that you'd know what to read?
 - A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Do you still have that piece of paper?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Did you give it to Mr. Bireley?
- 11 A. I more than likely did.
- 12 Q. Okay.
 - Mr. Bireley testified that that
- 14 disclaimer consists of Paragraphs 1 and 4 of the board
- 15 policy. Is that your recollection?
- 16 A. I never really put the two together, but now
- 17 that I read them, I would say that's probably it.
- 18 Q. Am I right in understanding, Mr. Walls, that
- it is the intention of the board prayer policy that no 19
- 20 one other than the adult members of the board would be
- 21 the object of the prayer?
- 22 A. That is the object.
- 23 Q. Am I then correct that in order to solemnify
- its proceedings, the prayer among the adult members of 24

41

Q. And that would be an effective way to

Q. The board of education could also solemnify its proceedings by having a member request a moment

Q. At the October 19th, 2004 board meeting when

Q. And did you invite someone to open the meeting

Q. Do you know whether you read a disclaimer of

some kind before the member offered the moment of

Q. Do you know what the text of that disclaimer

A. Not after having not read it for a year and a

the policy was adopted, you were president of the

- - the board could take place outside of the regular 1
 - 2 meeting immediately before the meeting?
 - 3 A. It could, but in my mind, that wouldn't
 - 4 solemnify the meeting.
 - 5 Q. Could you explain to me why not?
 - 6 A. The actual board meeting is the board's
 - 7 meeting that happens to be held in public. I would say
 - that there are Sunshine Laws that would prohibit the 8
 - 9 board from getting together before the meeting and ther
 - 10 going in and holding the meeting.
 - 11 Q. Have you completed your answer?
 - 12 A. To my knowledge, the board can't meet unless
 - 13 it advertises the meeting and opens it to the public.
 - 14 So if the board were to meet outside in the hallway
 - 15 with no one around, that would be an illegal meeting.
 - 16 Q. Have you completed your answer?
 - 17 A.
 - 18 Q. Did you ever request advice from anyone on
 - 19 that topic?
 - 20 A. No, not that I can remember.
 - 21 Q. Do you recall any discussion of that opinion,
 - 22 that is, that to meet immediately, immediately prior to
 - 23 walking on stage and taking your seats at the board
 - meeting, to meet solely for the purpose of having a 24

Walls, Harvey 10/25/2006 4:42:00 PM

 			vvalis, harvey 10/25/2006 4:42:00 PN
1	of the board?	1	A. I have.
2	A. No.	2	Q. Were there board meetings where you didn't
3	Q. Okay.	3	participate?
4	A. Not a regular scheduled.	4	A. Where I didn't participate in the prayer?
5	 Q. Yes, and we're talking about regular board 	5	Q. Did not participate in the prayer?
6	meetings	6	A. No.
7	A. Yes.	7	Q. What do you do to indicate when you're not
8	Q because that's what the board prayer policy	8	leading the prayer, what do you do to indicate that
9	applies to; correct?	9	you're participating?
10	A. Right.	10	 A. I don't know that I have to indicate anything.
11	 Q. All right. One difference between standing in 	11	Q. I didn't say that you had to. Do you do
12	the wings and having a prayer among the adult board	12	anything to indicate that you're participating in the
13	members and walking on stage and having a prayer once	13	prayer?
14	you sit down at the table is that there's an audience	14	 A. Occasionally I may say "amen" at the end.
15	for the on stage prayer; correct?	15	Q. Do you bow your head?
16	A. That's one difference.	16	A. Yes.
17	Q. Okay. With respect to the solemnification of	17	Q. Do you fold your hands in prayer?
18	the proceedings, can you think of any other difference	18	A. I don't fold my hands, no.
19	between the off stage prayer and the on stage prayer?	19	Q. Do you close your eyes when the prayer is
20	A. I don't know the differences. You have	20	offered?
21	mentioned one.	21	A. Yes.
22	Q. Is there any other difference that you can	22	Q. Is that your consistent practice to close your
23	think of, in terms of the impact on solemnifying the	23	eyes and bow your head?
24	proceedings, between a prayer off stage and a prayer o	24	A. Yes.
	49		51
1	stage?	1	Q. Would it be your expectation that members of
2	A. Not that I can think of.	2	the audience would close their eyes and bow their head
3	Q. Okay. Now let's talk about the difference in	3	during the offering of the prayer?
4	the impact on the solemnification of the board's	4	A. I have no expectation for the audience. They
5	proceedings because there's an audience for the on	5	can do whatever they wish.
6	stage prayer. Okay?	6	Q. In your view, Mr. Walls, is it necessary for a
7	Is that because, in your judgment, is	7	member of the board to open board meetings with a
8	that because the members of the audience also get the	8	prayer in order to solemnify the proceedings?
9	benefit of setting the tone for the meeting in the on	9	A. Is it necessary?
10	stage prayer?	10	Q. Yes.
11	 A. I would say they would get the benefit. 	11	A. No.
12	 Q. And they get the benefit because they observe 	12	 Q. To state it from the other direction, the
13	and participate in the prayer; is that correct?	13	board would it's your expectation that the board
14	A. No.	14	would conduct its proceedings in a solemn and dignified
15	Q. So they're not participating in the prayer?	15	and disciplined way whether it opened the meeting with
16	A. No.	16	a prayer or not, isn't that correct?
17	Q. Then how does it have an impact on them in	17	A. Yes.
18	terms of setting the tone for the meeting?	18	 Q. In special meetings of the board, it has been
19	A. I would think anybody who asks for guidance	19	the practice not to open those meetings with a prayer;
20	doesn't do it just asking for himself or herself.	20	correct?
21	Normally people, when a prayer is given, are respectful	21	A. Correct.
22	even though they're not asked to participate.	22	Q. Those meetings have been conducted, I take it,
23	Q. When prayers are offered at board meetings, do	23	in a solemn, respectful and disciplined way?
. 1 /1			o Honorully

24

A. Hopefully.

52

you participate?

1	A. Yes, I heard it.	1	years
2	Q. And did you find that disturbing as you	2	-
3	watched it, that people would be laughing at a	3	base
4	description of somebody disappearing?	4	
5	A. Yes. But I don't believe you saw me laughing	5	that t
6	on there.	6	Q.
7	Q. I don't think I did.	7	of the
8	Was it your voice at the beginning of	8	A.
9	the segment that I played for you that said something	9	Q.
10	along the lines of, "Sorry, Harold, I was going to say	10	A.
11	Earl"?	11	Home
12	 A. It could have been. And I don't know why I 	12	Q.
13	would have said that.	13	A.
14	Q. Do you recall that the August 24th meeting was	14	Q.
15	opened with a prayer?	15	throu
16	A. Yes.	16	A.
17	Q. You invited Dr. Hattier to give that prayer	17	Q.
18	A. That's correct.	18	A.
19	Q correct?	19	2001.
20	A. Correct.	20	Q.
21	Q. Did you know what prayer he was going to give?	21	A.

- 22 A. I did. 22
- 23 Q. How did you find out what prayer he was going 24 to give?

- rs. Something else too.
 - I have been a coach in Little League
- eball and Little League wrestling and football.
- Oh, American Legion, I'm a member of
- too.
- I should have asked you this at the beginning
- e deposition. Are you employed?
- Yes.
 - And what is your position?
- I'm a crematory manager at Parsell Funeral
- And is that in Georgetown?
 - That's one of them. It has four branches.
- And have you had -- did you have that job
- ughout your tenure as a school board member?
- No.
- What did you do?
- I worked at E.I. du Pont in Seaford until

24

6

15

17

18

- And that's when you took the job --
- Yes. I retired from DuPont and took the job
- with the funeral home.
- 23 Q. Thank you.
 - Were you surprised at the amount of
- 1
- A. He told me ahead of time when I asked him to 2
 - give the prayer. He told me it would be one by George
- 3 Washington.

1

- 4 Q. Do you know whether Dr. Hattier told anyone
- else what prayer he was going to give?
- 6 A. I don't know that.
- 7 Q. Did you tell anyone else what prayer
- 8 Dr. Hattier was going to give?
- 9 A. I don't know if I did or not.
- 10 Q. Do you recall that state representatives spoke
- 11 at the meeting?
- 12 A. Yes, there were three.
- 13 Q. Do you recall that they read a letter?
- 14
- 15 Q. Do you recall that the letter indicated
- knowledge of the prayer that Dr. Hattier was going to 16
- 17 give?
- 18 A. I don't recall that.
- 19 Q. Have you ever served as a member of any other
- 20 public body than the Indian River School Board?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. What bodies?
- 23 A. The Georgetown Jaycees, Sussex Central Pop

86

Warner Football. I was president of that for two

- attention that the school board prayer issue got? 2
 - A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Do you think that it attracted more attention

87

- 4 than it deserved among all the issues presented to the
- 5 school board?
 - A. Oh, definitely.
- 7 Q. I am going to ask you some questions about why
- 8 it might have gotten as much attention as it got.
- 9 Did you ever hear any constituent say to
- 10 you -- and by constituent, I mean student, parent,
- 11 resident of the district, fellow board member,
- 12 whatever -- did you ever hear any constituent say to
- 13 you, in words or substance, that the defense of this
- 14 lawsuit was a defense of Christian values?
 - A. I've heard that said.
- 16 Q. And could you tell me who you heard that from?
 - A. No, I couldn't.
 - Q. Could you tell me the group of which the
- person who said that was a member? 19
- 20 A. No.
- 21 MR. ALLINGHAM: All right. We have to
- 22 change the tape. Thank you.
- 23 VIDEO SPECIALIST: Going off the record
- 24 at 3:35 p.m.

Walls, Harvey 10/25/2006 4:42:00 PM

1 (Recess.) 2 VIDEO SPECIALIST: Going back on the 3 record at 3:41 p.m. 4 BY MR. ALLINGHAM: 5 Q. Right before we broke, Mr. Walls, I asked you 6 whether you had heard from anyone that the defense of 7 this lawsuit represented the defense of Christian 8 values, and you said yes. I asked you who said it, and

you didn't remember that either. Is it fair to say that you heard it more than once, however?

you didn't remember. I asked you from what group, and

- A. Yes, I'd say that's fair to say.
- 14 Q. When I asked you questions about the attendance, expected attendance --15
- 16 A. At the big meeting.
- Q. -- at the August 24th meeting, you told me you 17 18 knew it was going to be a big meeting, but you really
- 19 didn't know how, that you just hear things in Sussex
- 20 County; right, correct?
- A. Correct. 21

9

10

11

12

13

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

- 22 Q. Is it fair to say that it is a widely held
- 23 view in the Indian River District that the defense of
- this lawsuit represents a defense of Christian values?

- 1 Q. And is that, was that misperception or did the
- 2 comments reflect a misperception that the issue was
- 3 prayer in the schools rather than --
- 4 A. Yes.

5

7

- Q. -- school board?
- 6 A. I heard that from several of the speakers.
 - Q. Am I correct that you and the other board
- 8 members did not try to correct that misperception
- because the public comment section is meant to be an 9
- 10 opportunity for the board to hear from the public and
- not vice versa? 11
- 12 A. Correct.
- 13 Q. And that's something that the superintendent
- 14 had urged the board to remember; correct?
- 15
- 16 Q. Do you know whether at any time before or
- 17 after the adoption of the board prayer policy a member
 - of the public asked for a copy of the proposed policy
- 19 and was -- and that request was declined?
- 20 A. I don't remember if somebody specifically
- 21 asked.

18

- 22 Q. You never heard that a person asked for a copy
- 23 of the policy and was told that if they wanted it, they
- 24 should file a Freedom of Information Act request?

89

- A. There's a lot of perceptions out there about 1 2 this lawsuit, I think, and not all of them are correct.
 - Q. That may or may not be true, but it's not 100 percent responsive to my question.

Would you agree with me that it's a widely held view in the district that the defense of this lawsuit is a defense of Christian values?

- A. It's probably widely held in this district.
- Q. You mentioned some potential misperceptions
- 10 about this lawsuit.
- 11 A. Uh-huh.
- 12 Q. Could you tell me what you had in mind when you said that? 13
- 14 A. I hear things from time to time or see things, and I wondered where the people are coming from beca 15
- they act like they know, but I know that they don't. 16
- Q. So when you said that, you didn't have any 17
- 18 particular misperception in mind?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. Is it fair to say that a lot of the comments
- 21 at the August 24th board meeting reflected a
- 22 misperception about what the board was considering at
- 23 that time?
- 24 A. Yes.

- 1 A. I don't remember that.
 - Q. That would be contrary to --
- A. I mean but if this was the draft policy you're 3
- 4 talking about?
- Q. Yes, yes. 5
- 6 A. I can't see why someone would want a draft
- 7 policy.

2

8

- Q. Well --
- 9 A. And I don't know that the board has ever given
- 10 out a draft policy before it's actually adopted.
- Q. What is the purpose of the readings of the 11
- 12 policies?
- 13 A. In case the board has second thoughts or wants
- 14 to make changes on something, it gives a chance to do
- 15
- 16 Q. It is not intended to give the public an
- opportunity to review and comment on the policies? 17
- 18 A. After the first reading, yes, but I'm not
- 19 giving something out to the public before I give to the
- 20 board on a first reading.
- 21 Q. I thought we might be misunderstanding one
- 22 another.
- I'm talking about a request made for the 23
- 24 proposed policy after the first reading?

Wilson, Robert 12/14/2006 1:08:00 PM

```
FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE
                                                                                        I am here on behalf of the plaintiffs, along with Brian
       MONA DOBRICH and MARCO
                                                                                   2
       DOBRICH, Individually and
                                                                                   3
                                                                                                MR. SHAU: My name is Jarrod Shau. I'm
       as parents and next friend
       of ALEXANDER DOBRICH,
                                                                                        here on behalf of the defendants.
       SAMANTHA DOBRICH, JANE DOE
                                                                                   5
                                                                                                THE WITNESS: My name is Robert Wilson.
       and JOHN DOE, Individually
       and as parents and next
                                                                                   6
                                                                                                     ROBERT WILSON,
       friend of JORDAN DOE and
                                                                                   7
                                                                                            the deponent herein, having first been
       JAMIE DOE,
                                                                                   8
                                                                                            duly sworn on oath, was examined and
             Plaintiffs.
                                                                                   9
                                                                                            testified as follows:
                           ) Civil Action
                                                                                  10 BY MR. HORVATH:
                           ) No. 05-120
                                                                                         Q. Mr. Wilson, you are a member of the Indian
                                                                                  11
      INDIAN RIVER SCHOOL,
                                                                                        River School Board: correct?
                                                                                  12
      DISTRICT, et al.,
                                 )
                           )
                                                                                  13
                                                                                         A. That's right.
             Defendants.
                                                                                  14
                                                                                         Q. You have been a member since July 2006?
              Videotaped Deposition of ROBERT WILSON,
                                                                                  15
                                                                                         A. That's right.
      taken pursuant to notice at 31 Hosier Street.
      Selbyville, Delaware, beginning at 1:08 p.m., on
                                                                                  16
                                                                                         Q. And I am going to show you what has been
      Thursday, December 14, 2006, before Terry Barbano
                                                                                       marked PX-9. This is a copy of the school board prayer
                                                                                  17
      Burke, RMR-CRR and Notary Public.
      APPEARANCES:
                                                                                  18
                                                                                       policy
           RICHARD S. HORVATH, JR., ESQUIRE
                                                                                  19
                                                                                                Since you joined the school board, have
           BRIAN LENHARD, ESQUIRE
            One Rodney Square
                                                                                       you reviewed this policy?
                                                                                  20
            Wilmington, Delaware 19801
                                                                                         A. Yes.
                                                                                  21
            For the Plaintiff
                                                                                         Q. When did you review it?
                  WILCOX & FETZER
                                                                                  22
         1330 King Street - Wilmington, Delaware 19801
                                                                                         A. Pretty much when I first came on the board.
                                                                                  23
                  (302) 655-0477
                                                                                  24
                                                                                         Q. Was this policy given to you in a packet of
                  www.wilfet.com
                                                                           2
      APPEARANCES (cont'd):
                                                                                       other district policies?
           JARROD SHAU, ESQUIRE
 2
                                                                                         A. Pretty much. Well, no. This was actually by
                                                                                  2
           Drinker, Biddle & Reath, LLP
                                                                                  3
 3
            One Logan Square
                                                                                         Q. By Itself?
            18th and Cherry Streets
                                                                                  5
                                                                                         A. By itself.
            Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-6996
            For the Defendants
                                                                                  6
                                                                                         Q. Who gave it to you?
 5
                                                                                         A. I do not recall. I do not recall.
      ALSO PRESENT:
                                                                                  8
                                                                                         Q. Was it given to you at a school board meeting?
 6
                                                                                  9
                                                                                        A. Yes, it was,
           Lindsay duPhily, Videographer
                                                                                 10
                                                                                        Q. And it was given to you after you joined the
 7
 8
                                                                                      board as a part of your orientation?
                                                                                 11
              VIDEO SPECIALIST: This is a videotape
                                                                                 12
                                                                                        A. Yes -- no, not necessarily as an orientation,
10
      deposition of Mr. Robert Wilson taken by the plaintiff
                                                                                 13
                                                                                      but it was given to me after I joined the board.
11
      in the matter of Dobrich, et al. versus Indian River
                                                                                        Q. And after you received the policy, did you
      School District, et al., Civil Action No. 05-120.
12
                                                                                      discuss with any board members how the board prayer
13
              This is being held in the Indian River
14
      School District offices, 31 Hosier Boulevard,
                                                                                 16
                                                                                      policy operates?
     Selbyville, Delaware,
15
16
              We are going on the record on December
                                                                                        Q. Have you discussed with any school board
     14th, 2006, at approximately 1:08 p.m.
17
                                                                                 19
                                                                                      members what prayers would be prohibited under the
18
              The court reporter is Terry Burke from
     the firm of Wilcox & Fetzer, Wilmington, Delaware. My
19
                                                                                 20
                                                                                      policy?
20
     name is Lindsay duPhily and the videotape specialist of
                                                                                 21
     Discovery Video Services.
21
                                                                                 22
                                                                                        Q. Have you discussed with any school board
22
             Counsel will now introduce themselves and
                                                                                 23
                                                                                     members why the board opens its public meetings with
     then the court reporter will swear in the witness.
23
24
             MR. HORVATH: My name is Richard Horvath.
```

7

14

15

24

4

9

17

Wilson, Robert 12/14/2006 1:08:00 PM

want. It's just like a Jehovah Witness coming to my house. I listen to what they have to say. I don't agree with it, I'm not rude and I'm not ignorant.

The same thing is with other types of religions. I'm very tolerant of other religions. If they want to share that with me. I'm not saying my religion's the only religion. That's not exactly at all what I'm trying to do.

That's just my way of being taught, that's my teaching. That's what I believe.

An atheist believes there's not a God. That's his belief. That's fine.

- Q. You said same opportunity. Do you understand that the opportunity we're talking about here is offering a prayer at the start of school board meetings?
- 17 A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

- Are members of the community who are not 18 19 school board members offered an opportunity to give a
- 20 prayer at the start of school board meetings?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. So they don't have the same opportunity that
- 23 you have when it comes to offering a prayer at school 24 board meetings?

you physically when you ask for the intervention?

2 A. Yes, it does. I think when you do it in the

3 public like that, I think it shows that you can come 4 together, and that's one thing that a lot of people

5 have in common. And when we say a prayer at a board

6 meeting, 99 percent of the people do take part.

Q. Of the people, you mean the people present?

8 A. Of the people present, they do take part. I 9 have been able to look around at several times and 10 there are people that have heads bowed. We have not 11 had anybody run out in a rave, I guess you would say.

12 It's just a way to publicly come together as a board. 13

Q. Thank you, sir.

The board prayer in some way is for the benefit of everyone in attendance?

- 16 A. That's exactly right.
- 17 Q. And the public will not benefit from that if 18 the board prayer is outside of the public's presence?
- 19 A. I don't think it shows the same kind of unity.
- 20 We want the public to take part in the prayer. That's
- 21 the whole thing behind the public board meeting. If a
- 22 person wants to come forward after a meeting and say
- 23 that there was an issue with that, I can see us
 - changing it, rewording it, working with them, maybe

29

A. No. 1

4

13

- 2 Q. Why is it of the utmost importance to ask and 3 pray for divine guidance from Our Heavenly Father?
 - A. I would say, I have to look at our
- 5 Constitutional government, our House of Representative
- 6 opens up with a word of prayer. Why is it important
- 7 for them to do it? We feel -- I think people on the
- board feel whether it -- when we pray to God, now 8
- 9 understand that a God, when I say God, I'm praying to
- 10 God, or you're praying to God, you could mean Allah or
- 11 any other God, but praying to God is praying to God.
- 12 Do you understand what I mean by that?
 - Q. Unfortunately, sir, I don't feel like you're
- 14 answering my question. I asked you why is it
- 15 important?
- 16 A. It's more of a -- it's just a way, I guess, we 17 communicate through God asking for his divine
- 18 intervention. Okay, to a God for divine intervention,
- 19 whether it be my God or another person's God.
- 20 Q. Do you believe that divine intervention will
- 21 help you make better decisions?
- 22 A. Yes. I do.
- 23 Q. It doesn't matter where you ask for divine
- intervention, does it? And by where, I mean where are

- 1 even offering them to say a prayer.
- 2 Q. Do you think that's likely after what happened 3 to the Dobriches?
 - A. Yes, I do.
- 5 Q. I am going to show you a copy of what's been 6 previously marked as PX-72.

7 It's a copy of the May 3rd, 2006 issue 8 of the Delaware Wave.

- A. Okay.
- 10 Q. If you will look on the second page, it's
- marked P-2439 at the bottom. I think you're already on 11
- 12
- 13 A. Yeah.
- 14 Q. Were you sent a series of questions for this 15
 - article?
- 16 A. Yes, I was.
 - Q. And did one of those questions involve the
- 18 prayer suit?
- 19 A. I don't -- let me look here and I'll tell you.
- 20 It evidently was, yes.
- 21 Q. You responded to, I guess it's a query, On
- 22 board's refusal to settle prayer suit, your response
- 23 was, "I am very proud of this school board and the

32

24 stand they took. It took a lot of courage to stand

2004

Academic Achievement Banquet

> May 13, 2004 6:30 PM Southern Delaware School of the Arts

Program

Welcome

Denise C. Speicher

Supervisor Of Secondary Instruction

Musical Selections Southern Delaware School of Arts "The Road Show"

Conducted by Frank Mahoney

Invocation

Reverend Marvin Morris

Dinner

Remarks

Lois Hobbs, Superintendent

Indian River School District

Guest Speaker

Dr. Jackie O. Wilson

Presentations

Harvey Walls, President, Board of Education

Lois Hobbs, Superintendent

Mark Steele, Principal, Indian River High School Donna Hall, Principal, Sussex Central High School Ray Steele, Asst. Principal, Indian River High School Duncan Smith, Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School Tim Slade, Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School

Benediction

Reverend Marvin Morris

Dinner Catered by Georgia House

Guests of Honor

Ashley Adams Mark D. Ahlfeldt Melissa Alesi Stephen C. Alesi Lauren Baker Laura Bamaca Lucas F. Beam Kathleen M. Bernsten Timothy V. Berzins Matthew T. Binsted Begona Blasco Katie N. Blatzheim Andrew J. Bokinsky Elizabeth Booth Chad E. Brasure Scott D. Bulkeley Jamie Bunting Julie E. Butters Nicholas Cain Catherine C. Clark Kate Collins Gwendolyn Conaway Andrew Cordell Bianey Cordoba Amanda Cordrey Richard Cordrey Mallory E. Cropper Elizabeth M. Daniel Arthur E. Davidson Renee A. Davidson Amanda Dean Angela C. Delario Daniel Desiderio Samantha Dobrich Mary Ellen M. DuPont Brandi Eckler Edwin J. Edwards III Samuel Ehrick Allison Erskine Erica E. Evans Jennifer L. Evans Stephanie Ewell Joyce Ferido Timothy Fike Nicholas B. Firlein Insley Fowler Hetcher Garrison Julie Garvilla Stacey Garvilla

Cassandra M. Gibbs Benjamin T. Gichner Richard J. Giorgilli Jordan R. Hale Timothy S. Hale Cynthia Harvey Garrett A. Hastings Tyler R. Hastings Marie Haughey Christina A. Hensler Lance Hickman Beth Hitchens Jamie Hoffer Lauren Hoffman Ashley R. Hudson Amanda Hunsberger Samantha Hyler Cory Jackson Brandy Jester Amanda L. Johnson Thomas C. Jurusik Нуип Кіт Ji Kim Dezaray King Nicole E. Kline Sara Lawrence Shannon Lecates Robin M. Lee James M. Lewis Chelsea Leyh Chad Lingenfelder Julie Macklin Adam Maloney Charles Marshall Andrew Martin Keili A. Marvel Kenneth Matthias Kalonna Maull Sara McCabe Kelly A. McCreary Colin McIlvaine Sara Milam Lauren Miller Holly C. Miskin Susan Mitchell Cara A. Morris Trey Mumford Joshua Myers

Dana Peragallo Bonnie Plum Jacquelyn M. Powers Brittany Proudfoot Michelle Pusey Thomas J. Reichert Stephanie L. Richter Brandon K, Rickwood Kathryn R. Riley Gretchen A. Ritter Karalyn A. Roach Peter O. Roenki Erin L. Sagers Sean M. Santiago Glen Saunders Kristen Schaeffer Whitney Shanefelter Lauren E. Sheats Krista K. Showalter Jonathan Siletta Darell Singleterry Chelsea Sizemore Dannitra Snead Elizabeth Stacey Lindsay Steele Rachel Stevenson Tshnina Street Pamela E. Townsend Brittany A. Truitt Melissa Turpin Caitlind Twyford Allison Vari Ann C. Veith Stephanie Walls Laura B. Walter Stephanie N., Ware Kayla D. Warrington Lindsay Watson Kaitlynn M. Wells John Wheeler Kyle White Shanette White Heather Wilkerson Tori Williams Sharde'N, Wise Maegen Wren Jennifer Zezenski

Students in bold are those who have been honored four consecutive years.

Megan A. Orhelein

Board of Education

Harvey Walls, President Charles Bireley Nina Lou Bunting Richard Cohee John Evans Reginald Helms, Vice President Gregory Hastings Donald Hattier Mark Isaacs Elaine McCabe

Administration

Lois M. Hobbs Superintendent Earl Savage Asst. Superintendent

Susan Bunting, Ed.D.
Director, Dept. of Instruction

Jay Headman Administrative Assistant

Denise C. Speicher Supervisor, Secondary Instruction Mark Steele Principal, Indian River High School

Donna Hall, Ed.D Principal, Sussex Central High School Ray Steele

Asst. Principal, Indian River High School

Tim Slade Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School Duncan Smith

Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School

Appreciation is extended to the Southern Delaware School of the Arts and Indian River Educational Complex custodial staff for their cooperation and work towards preparation of the 2004 Academic Achievement Banquet. Further acknowledgement is given to Denise Speicher, Frank Mahoney & The Road Show, and Lauren Grise & her Southern Delaware School of the Arts Honor Society students. A special thanks also goes to Hans Anderson of the Southern Delaware School of the Arts for operating the sound system.

"The Road Show" Dance Coordinator – Elizabeth Whealton Musical Arranger & Director – Frank Mahoney

Ryan Cannon Victoria Clark Shelby Collins Cristin Corbin Kelsey Daisey Michelle Giorgilli Alex Gundermann Maurice Hein Lucas Kerns Colleen Mahaffie Wayde Marsh Eli Mumford Alyssa Murray Nicole Nadig

J. T. Norton Chris Pridgeon Sarah Purdum Zack Smith Latoya Walters Matt Wiltshire Case 1:05-cv-00120-JJF Document 265-3 Filed 05/08/2008 Page 41 of 59

EXHIBIT 18

Filed 05/08/2008

2003

Academic Achievement Banquet

May 14, 2003 6:30 PM Southern Delaware School of the Arts

Program

Welcome

Denise C. Speicher

Supervisor Of Secondary Instruction

Musical Selections

Southern Delaware School of Arts "The Road Show"

Conducted by Frank Mahoney

Invocation

Reverend Marvin Morris

Dinner

'Remarkş

Lois Hobbs, Superintendent

Indian River School District

Guest Speaker

Ileana Smith, Ed.D.

Presentations

Charles Bireley, President of Board of Education

Lois Hobbs, Superintendent

Mark Steele, Principal, Indian River High School Donna Hall, Principal, Sussex Central High School Ray Steele, Asst. Principal, Indian River High School Duncan Smith, Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School Tim Slade, Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School

'Benediction

Reverend Marvin Morris

Menu

Entrée

Roast Beef au jus Breast of Chicken

Vegetables

Mashed Potatoes Broccoli with Cheese Sauce Green Peas & Pearl Onions

Salad

Tossed Salad

Ambrosia

Dessert

Strawberry Tart

Hot Rolls - Butter Coffee - Iced Tea Mints & Nuts

Guests of Honor

Ashley Adams Melissa Adkins Justin Albright Melissa Alesi Alexandra Ambrose Jamie Baker Lauren Beam James Bennett III Nicole Berzins Courtney Betton Linley Betton Danielle Blake Andrew Bokinsky Brittany Booth Amber Brasure Chad Brasure Jamie Bunting Nelson Bunting Sarah Burton Timothy Butters Jennifer Byus Stacey Campbell Sheena Carter William Chandler IV Michelle Ciampo Catherine Clark Justin Cohee Jason Collins Julie Collins Kate Collins Gwendolyn Conaway Heather Conroe Jeffrey Cook Ir. Carin Corbin Andrew Cordell Bianey Cordoba Brett Cordrey Richard Cordrey Maria Counts Mallory Cropper Elizabeth Daniel

Angela Delario Erin DeMoss Samantha Dobrich Paige Doeberl Amy Donovan Mary DuPont Stacey Dykes Brandi Eckler Edwin Edwards III Candace Esham Samantha Feld Joyce Ferido Timothy Fike Jessica Fisher Chelsie Frey Jessica Garcia Fletcher Garrison Stacey Garvilla Benjamin Gichner Richard Giorgilli Kaylynn Gland Ronchelle Godwin John Gooss Shannon Gotte Jacqueline Gray Iordan Hale Timothy Hale Katlin Harker Amanda Hastings Grant Hastings Tyler Hastings Marie Haughey Kyle Helke Eric Henderson Christina Hensler Beth Hitchens Joshua Hitchens Jamie Hoffer Matthew Hoffman Lauren Hoffman Ashley Hudson

Amanda Hunsberger Samantha Hyler Dona Inthaxoum William Ireland Jr. Cory Jackson Daryl Jackson Kimberly Jones Thomas Jurusik Jee Hee Kim Dezaray King Laura Kleinstuber Nathaniel Kortvelesy Sara Lawrence Matthew Lewis Alexis Leyh Chelsea Leyh Krista Littleton Laura Long Ashley Lynch Julie Macklin Adam Maloney Charles Marshall Aleni Martin Andrew Martin Ashleigh Martz Julie Matthias Kenneth Matthias Amanda McCracken Becky McDowell Erin McDowell Colin McIlvaine Haley Mitchell Susan Mitchell Beth Moore Lindsey Moore Kyle Murray Lagina Nosavanh Jessica Nowacki Megan Orhelein Bina Patel Dana Peragallo

Brittany Proudfoot Michelle Pusey Kathryn Riley Gretchen Ritter Emily Robinson Erin Sagers Glen Saunders Amanda Schleifer Ashley Schutt Bradley Schutt Louis Schwartz Lauren Sheats Genny Shinn Amanda Short Ashley Short Krista Showalter Darell Singleterry Chelsea Sizemоте Margaret Stasi Rachel Stevenson Shaun Thompson Tiffany Tribbitt Eric Tsavdar Melissa Turpin Caitlind Twyford Taylor Vanderhook Dana Vogel Laura Walter Stephanie Ware Ryan Warner Kayla Warrington Brandy West Christopher White Kyle White Shanette White Tyler Wilkins Heather Willey Tori Williams Jessica Willing Maegen Wren Haley Wyatt

Students in bold are those who have been honored four consecutive years.

Board of Education

Charles Bireley, President Nina Lou Bunting Richard Cohee John Evans Gregory Hastings

Harvey Walls, Vice President Donald Hattier Reggie Helms Mark A. Isaacs Elaine McCabe

Administration

Lois M. Hobbs

Earl Savage

Superintendent

Asst. Superintendent

Susan Bunting, Ed.D. Director, Dept. of Instruction Denise C. Speicher

Supervisor, Secondary Instruction

Mark Steele

Donna Hall, Ed.D

Principal, Indian River High School

Principal, Sussex Central High School

Ray Steele

Duncan Smith

Asst. Principal, Indian River High School

Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School

Tim Slade Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School

Appreciation is extended to the Southern Delaware School of the Arts cafeteria staff, as well as the Southern Delaware School of the Arts and Indian River Educational Complex custodial staff, for their cooperation and work towards preparation of the 2003 Academic Achievement Banquet. Further acknowledgement is given to Denise Speicher, Carmen Deldeo, Frank Mahoney & The Road Show, Lauren Grise & her Southern Delaware School of the Arts Honor Society students.

"The Road Show" Dance Coordinator - Elizabeth Whealton Musical Arranger & Director - Frank Mahoney

Eli Muniford J. T. Norton Cristin Corbin Emily Southmayd Wayde Marsh Matt Wiltshire Maurice Hein Jeremy Pedersen Victoria Clark Alyssa Murray Andrea Picazo Colleen Mahaffie Danielle Dell Lucas Kerns Sarah Purdum Kasey Cordell Kelsey Daisey Emily Barton Michell Giorgilli

Amy Johnson Erin Kortvelesy Cori McCowan Nicole Nadig Erika Parlett Cassidy Seabolt Loree Vickio Chris Pridgeon Zach Smith

Case 1:05-cv-00120-JJF Document 265-3 Filed 05/08/2008 Page 46 of 59

EXHIBIT 19

Indian River School District

2002

Academic Achievement Banquet

May 15, 2002 6:30 PM Southern Delaware School of the Arts

Program

Welcome

Denise C. Speicher

Supervisor Of Secondary Instruction

Invocation

Reverend Marvin Morris

Booker Street Church of God

Musical Selections SDSA's "The Road Show"

Conducted by Frank Mahoney

Dinner

Remarks

Lois Hobbs, Superintendent

Indian River School District

Guest Speaker

Everett Toomey, Ed.D.

Presentations

Charles Bireley, President Board of Education

Lois Hobbs, Superintendent Mark Steele, Principal, IRHS Donna Hall, Principal, SCHS Ray Steele, Asst. Principal, IRHS Duncan Smith, Asst. Principal, SCHS Tim Slade, Asst. Principal, SCHS

Benediction

Reverend Marvin Morris

Menu

Entrée Roast Beef au jus

Breast of Chicken

Vegetables Mashed Potatoes Broccoli with Cheese Sauce Green Peas & Pearl Onions

Salad Tossed Salad Ambrosia

Dessert Strawberry Tart

Hot Rolls - Butter Coffee - Iced Tea Mints & Nuts

Guests of Honor

Ashley M. Adams Melissa M. Alesi Laura Bader Jamie Baker Lauren Beam Richard Bell Nicote Berzins Danielle M. Blake Amanda L. Bly Brittany M. Booth Amber R. Brasure Kelly J. Brittin Michelle Brittingham Steven L. Brumberg Tyler J. Bryan Jennifer L. Bunting Nelson J. Bunting Stacey L. Campbell Ashley B. Cannon Nathan L. Carr II Sheena L. Carter Nicole E. Chafin William B. Chandler Aisha Choudhri Catherine Clark Justin Cohee Holly Collins Julie R. Collins Angela J. Colone Heather Conroe Bianey Cordoba John Cordrey Brett A. Cordrey Candy L. Couch Brittany A. Croll Mallory O. Cropper Elizabeth M. Daniel Christine L. Deck Angela C. Delario Megan B. Disharoon Samantha Dobrich Danielle L. Dorman Stacey R. Dykes Edwin J. Edwards III Dayna L. Elliott Candace E. Esham Candice A. Evans Samantha E. Feld Joyce A. Ferido Jessica Fisher Insley M. Fowler Samantha E. Frazier Kaylynn R. Gland Charmion A. Gray

Jacqueline Gray Michelle C. Gray Heather R. Hale Jordan R. Hale Katlin E. Harker Renee L. Harmon Candice R. Harris **Grant Hastings** Angela M. Hauck Samantha C. Hauck Crystal L. Haymond Jennifer M. Hazzard Jessica L. Hazzard Kyle Helke Eric J. Henderson Christina Hensler Mark D. Hernandez Beth R. Hitchens Jamie C. Hoffer Lauren R. Hoffman Meghan B. Howlett Jessica L. Hudson Frank E. Hudson III Amanda Hunsberger William Hyler Dona Inthaxoum Nicole M. Ireland Daryl Jackson Ashley Jones Kimberly Jones Jee Kim Dezaray King Laura A. Kleinstuber Sara Lawrence Robin E. Lee Matthew D. Lewis Alexis Levh Hien Luu Ashley Lynch Julie Macklin Lesley Maloney Aleni Martin Andrew Martin Ashleigh Martz Douglas M. Marvel Julie Matthias Kenneth Matthias Erin McDowell Shannah Messick Anthony Milam Daniel Milam Christopher Mireider Haley B. Mitchell Beth Moore

Lindsey Moore Ronald O. Morgan, Jr. Leslie M. Morin Matthew Murray Jason T. Nauman Lagina Nosavanh Craig S. Oliver Megan A. Orhelein Stephanie Parker **David Parsons** Bina Patel Devon E. Pennell Dana Peragallo Colleen S. Powell Jacquelyn M. Powers Michelle Pusey Kyle Ricker Brandon K. Rickwood Jenna Riddle Gretchen A. Ritter **Emily Robinson** Ravin E. Robinson Amanda Schleifer Ashley Schutt **Bradley Schutt** Genny Shinn Amanda Short Ashley Short Darion Showell Darel Singleterry, Jr. Chelsea Sizemore Luke Sizemore Tabitha Smith Margaret Stasi Rachel Stevenson Casey Strohmeyer Kristy Ten Shaun Thompson Justin M. Tomlinson Tiffany A. Tribbitt Eric J. Tsavdar Christopher Uibel Taylor Vanderhook Stephanie N. Ware Ryan Warner Courtney West Jennifer Westfall Megan M. Wharton Kyle White Hillary Wright Dong Yang Brandy S. Yost

Students in italics are those who have been honored four consecutive years.

Board of Education

Charles Bireley, President Gregory Hastings Richard Cohee John Evans Reginald Helms

Joseph Booth Elaine McCabe Lewis Patterson **Everett Toomey** Harvey Walls

Administration

Lois M. Hobbs Superintendent

Mark L. Steele Principal, Indian River High School

Susan Bunting, Ed.D. Director, Dept. of Instruction

Ray L. Steele

Asst. Principal, Indian River High School

Denise Speicher Supervisor, Secondary Instruction

Duncan Smith

Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School

Donna Hall, Ed.D.

Principal, Sussex Central High School

Asst. Principal, Sussex Central High School

Appreciation is extended to the Southern Delaware School of the Arts cafeteria staff, as well as the Southern Delaware School of the Arts and IREC custodial staff, for their cooperation and work towards preparation of the 2002 Academic Achievement Banquet. Further acknowledgement is given to Denise Speicher, Carmen Deldeo, Frank Mahoney & The Road Show, Lauren Grise & her Southern Delaware School of the Arts Honor Society students, and Becky Mott-Lynn, Mark Mott-Lynn, and Cathy Macklin & the Art students from Southern Delaware School of the Arts, Sussex Central High School, and Indian River High School.

The Road Show

Ricker Adkins Lee Bailey Linley Betton Victoria Clark Cristin Corbin Danielle Diaz Michelle Giorgilli Ricky Giorgilli Patrizia Gugliotta Marc Hayden

Maurice Hein Lance Hickman Lucas Kems Nick Kieper Erin Kortvelesv Wayde Marsh Cori McCowan Eli Mumford Cory Murray J. T. Norton

Mary Pawlina Jeremy Pedersen Chris Pridgeon Josh Ritter Rachel Silkworth Emily Southmayd Robbie Syphard Connor Vanderhook Elizabeth Whealton (Dance Coordinator)

EXHIBIT 20

BBF

SCHOOL BOARD MEMBER ETHICS

Members of the Board of Education will strive to attain the following Code of Ethics adopted by the Board of Directors of the National School Board Association, May 2, 1961:

1. As a member of my local Board of Education, representing all the citizens of my school district, I recognize

That my fellow citizens have entrusted me with the educational development of the children and youth of this community.

That the public expects my first and greatest concern to be in the best interest of each and every one of these young people without distinction as to who they are or what their background may be.

That the future welfare of this community, of this State, and of the nation depends in the largest measure upon the quality of education we provide in the public schools to fit the needs of every learner.

That my fellow board members and I must take the initiative in helping all the people of this community to have all the facts all the time about their schools, to the end that they will readily provide the finest possible school program, school staff, and school facilities.

That legally the authority of the Board is derived from the State which ultimately controls the organization and operation of the school district and which determines the degree of discretionary power left with the Board and the people of this community for exercise of local autonomy.

That I must never neglect my personal obligation to the community and my legal obligation to the State, nor surrender these responsibilities to any other person, group or organization; but that beyond these, I have a moral and civic obligation to the nation which can remain strong and free only so long as public schools in the United States of America are kept free and strong.

2. In view of the foregoing consideration, it shall be my constant endeavor:

To devote time, thought and study to the duties and responsibilities of a school board member so that I may render effective and creditable service.

To work with my fellow board members in a spirit of harmony and cooperation in spite of difference of opinion that arise during vigorous debate of points of issue.

To base my personal decision upon all available facts in each situation; to vote my honest conviction in every case, unswayed by partisan bias of any kind; thereafter, to abide by and uphold the final majority decision of the Board.

Filed 05/08/2008

To remember at all times that as an individual I have no legal authority outside the meetings of the Board and to conduct my relationship with the school staff, and local citizenry, and all media of communication on the basis of this fact.

To resist every temptation and outside pressure to use my position as a school board member to benefit either myself or any other individual or agency apart from the total interest of the school district.

To recognize that it is as important for the Board to understand and evaluate the educational program of the schools as it is to plan for the business of school operation.

To bear in mind under all circumstances that the primary function of the Board is to establish the policies by which the schools are to be administered, but that the administration of the education program and the conduct of school business shall be left to the employed superintendent of schools and his professional and non-professional staff.

To welcome and encourage active cooperation by citizens, organizations, and the media of communication in the district with respect to establishing policy on current school operation with proposed future developments.

To support my State and National School Boards Associations.

Finally, to strive step by step toward ideal conditions for most effective school board service to my community, in a spirit of teamwork and devotion to public education as the greatest instrument for the preservation and perpetuation of our representative democracy.

Case 1:05-cv-00120-JJF Document 265-3 Filed 05/08/2008 Page 54 of 59

EXHIBIT 21

Serving the Heart of Sussex County

50 cents

Action of Thursday, May 8, 2008

In District Five three canddates will seek two seats on the school board. Longtime incumbent Regate L. Helms and intested seats on the Indian River cumbent Donna M. Mitchell will face a challenge from political newcomer.Sharon Brillingham. uesday. Nina dates will be seeking three con-Lou Burning will be returned to DACSBORO AND Six cand office since she is running unop

School Board on "

office for the first time. He is the Mr. Walters, 51, is running for spent seven years working as a student adviser in the Indian Riv-Supervisor of transportation for the Millord School District and er Schöol District. He called for better communication and more posed for another term in District Christopher A. White for the one In District Four incumbent Dr. Donald G. Hattler will face chall

engers Harold

seat available

accountability

By Michael Short

Sussex Post

he district and the community," ie said. He said his experience in he community, working in two mer Indian River student all give ljust think we need a (better) working relationship between school districts and being a forhim valuable experience.

Mr. Walters said he supports think that when the kids dress better and look better, they act school uniforms for students. "J better,"

"It is a good district. It has

coard needs people with more

diverse backgrounds and more

Mr. White is a former MBNA employee who now works in sales for Mountaire. He said the

what's best for the kids."

real world experience and he believes his experience in the corporate world would be a plus. some great teachers and some great students. We just need to be on the same page to make it

that much greater," he said.

needs to resist the urge to be obard to giver gear direction," he Mr. White said the board loo involved in day-to-day op "You need to get on th erations The Pies He said a good school board member needs to be "somebody who is going to be honest with you and somebody who has no agenda. My only agenda is

said he is very concerned about trict and at the state level. More He called for more student graduation rates, both in the disand parental involvement and

See Election —

Students soar: Eagle Company teaches life skill



Continued From Page

involvement by parents and stuscores and graduation rates, he dents could

the board needs to update its ethics policy which or fiscal responsibility and said he district needs to make sure it manages its finances in the best dates back to He also said ossible fashion.

He believes in a strict dress odé policy, saying it creates a efter learning environment.

o the position and he pledged to mind and real world experience sten and gather all the facts be-He said he brings an open ore making a decision,

"You have to have an ... and no personal mind

ore becoming a member of the Dr. Hattier is a chiropractor. school board and he has been in le served on the district's finandal committee for two years behe forefront of the district's study of a possible school uniform.

cause "I think there are a lot of things that are unfinished." He funding cuts to education and He decided to run again be He is concerned about possi-



сотрlishments of the district.

I feel passionately about pub dren, and by extension, for every said. "I want the best for my chil lic education and its benefits. body else's children as well."

Mr. Helms has served on the vant's heart." He explained that a position like school board is taken because people want to help and called it "an honor and a privilege" to be able to serve the school board for 17 years and he said that a good school board member needs to have "a ser. public,

Document 265-3

lenges will be how to deal with possible budget cuts, aithough inal state cuts have yet to be de-He said one of the biggest chal

cuts)," he said, "It will be a challenge to maintain those test scores and cut \$1 million (in possible state cuts) out of the bud "I don't want to touch thing in the classroom (with

He said his constituents have told him they support prayer be-



Harold

and other employment costs have ceep cutting funding and expect state has eliminated the school budget in our district alone. At the same time, salaries risen dramatically ... You can't a total of 6 million dollars from he same good product."

looking at Indian River's policy as in its religion policy (following a He said the board's changes and school districts are now the students more flexibility awsuit over school a possible model

pending and that portion deals with whether or not the school board should be able to open its meetings with a prayer. He said he supports the opening prayer One part of that lawsuit is still and believes it is constitutional

or building rebuilding and mod-Dr. Hattier said he has worked lo increase participation in music ports district efforts to supplement reading programs. He is quick to note the high test scores, the maand arts programs and he sup-





Brittingham

iver before the board meetif the school board meetings, don't see a thing wrong with

ird member heeds to be open Mr. Helms said a good school nded, do their homework and ve no personal agendas.

have a willingness to work a people person and a "[consider He said he understands both th people," he said. oblem solver,"

forms, but generally is sups of the debate over whether district should have school "We've done well. That takes roup of people. It also takes a le said the district has had tate the people allowing me **"**| ap and that cares," he said, od academic success tive of the idea.

school board for three years Jonna Mitchell has served on has been chair of the policy amittee for the last two years.

he negative things that happen, think we all need guidance school board

She said dealing with possible budget cuts is a major concern for the district and said that the state's equalization formula makes it dif. ficult for districts like indian River ficult trying to fund all-day kinderis an unfunded mandate from the to get ahead. She also said it's dif garten because that requirement State

"Overall, I would say Indian is iust about as good as it gets, but there River is a wonderful school district. I am very proud of it..... is always room for improvement, think the school district she said.

She said a good school board have to have the pulse of what's member must be willing to do of time to the board. "You really their homework and commit a lot happening," she said,

always been involved with Little She considers herself a "watchdog" for children and said she has League, booster clubs or other vouth activities.

"My whole life has been about she said. "Kids have been life. That's my passion." kids,"

having served as a coach, teacher à and principal. She now works at fensive experience in education. Sharon Brittingham has

Delaware and says her experi ence is a major plus.

stand the diverse needs of this community ... and I can be a voice for people who sometimes derstanding that one size does don't have a voice. I bring an undifferent perspectives; not fit all," she said.

She said she is passionate and wants to investigate ways to about early childhood education increase high school graduation rates. She prides herself on being able to think out of the box and explore different ideas.

Ms. Brittingham said the school district may need to look at more such as perhaps culinary arts. She technical offerings that might not be available from Sussex Tech, said it's just a matter of seeing what programs are available and trying to give students more options to help them better compete globally.

She thinks the district should ticeships as part of that effort to explore internships and apprenprovide more options. She supports the ESL (English as a second language) and the Village Programs offered by the district.

out of the box," she said. "I'm all about kids and what's in the best

"I think I understand a lot of

		"A single board member can only do so much. If you don't have support of the other nine, nothing's going to happen."	"I'm an Indian River kid of the past planning to give kids of the present and future a voice."	"Education is the best legacy that we can leave our kids that's free of charge."		"I put kids first in anything I do."
		Plans if elected See prayer lawsuit through to end improve Sussex Central High School's graduation rate and add music programs.	Estrive to increase public communication with the school board.	Take a look at district ethics policies and get more children involved in extra-curricular activities.		Work to examine policies of the school board, many of whick phavent being chalged in decades, Examine ways to help more strictural graduate.
PISTRICT COLID	1004	Financial stability Music and the arts Prayer	■ Improving relations between the community and the district ■ Ensuring the continuing education of students	 Ethics Graduation rates Fiscal responsibility 	DISTRICT. FIVE	Finance Drop-out rate Early-childhood programs
HSIG.	-	Employment Chitropractor	Currently a truancy officer and superintendent of transportation for the Milford School District.	Sales manager for Mountaire Farms.	DISTR	Currently works for Delaware Academy of School Lendership.
	Function	Six years on board, eight years on the district's finance committee and has four children in the school district.	Brought up in the Indian River School District, worked as student advisor in Indian River and Millord school districts for several years.	Father of two district students, commissioner of South Bethany Planning & Zoning Board.		Former principal of Frankford Elementary School and Cotton inches of Delaware Frotessional Standard Soard Frotessional Standard Frot
		Donald Hattier	Harold Walters		Chris White	Sharon Brittingham

; " "	Case 1:05-cv-00120-JJ	F Document 265-3	Filed 05/08/2008	Page 59 of 59
		• •		
of the past planning to give kids of the present and future a voice."	"Education is the best legacy that we can leave our kids that's free of charge."	"I put kids first in anything I do."	servant's heart. It's a privile and the servant's of Indian Reamfully and the constitution. Think we're doing an excellent job on excellent job on the constitution.	always room for improvement.
public communication with the school board.	Take a look at district ethics policies and get more children involved in extra-curricular activities.	■ Work to examine policies of the school board, many of which haven't been changed in decades, Examine ways to help more-students graduate. ***	quality of education in the district through the client ing glands are that think ing glands are that think is specifically the district is specifically the district is specifically the district in the prayer before meetings, improve on district's are.	demic standards and see prayer lawsuit to a concinsion
between the community and the district Ensuring the continuing education of students	■ Ethics ■ Graduation rates ■ Fiscal responsibility Fiscal responsibility Fiscal responsibility	Enance Drop-out rate Early-childhood programs of the first of the f	Improving education Improving	
officer and superintendent of transportation for the Milford School District.	Sales manager for Mountaire Farms.	Currently works for Delaware Academy of School Lendership.	employee. ***********************************	site in Selbyville.
Brougnt up in the indian River School District, worked as student advisor in Indian River and Milford school districts for several years.	Father of two district students; commissioner of South Bethany Planning & Zoning Board.	her principal of kford Elementary of and the few rate serionis Standards d. S.	it, holding theres had no president, vice a sidentific that man variors countinged to the counting the same of the counting the cou	district, with two sons now-teaching at district schools.
Haroid Walteis	Chris White	Form Fran State Fran Fran Fran Fran Fran Fran Fran Fran	Reginald Helins	Donna' Mitchell